SBG Management Services, Inc. v. Philadelphia Gas Works
Dockets Nos. C-2012-2304215, C-2012-2304167, C-2012-2304303; C-2012-2304183, C-2012-2304324, C-2012-2308453, C-2012-2308454, C-2012-2308465

# SBG MANAGEMENT SERVICES, INC. RESPONSES TO PGW'S REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS AND INTERROGATORIES SET I

#### INTERROGATORY/REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS:

#### PGW Interrogatory/Request

1. For each separate Disputed Transaction, as defined in (I) above, that is based upon the allegation that the monthly usage and/or meter reading for the disputed transaction is incorrect and/or designated by SBG Dispute Code "A" (Excessive Billings) as defined the SBG Accounting Dispute Binder Code legend in Appendix I, which is attached hereto, please provide SBG's calculation of the correct bill for each disputed transaction. That is, where SBG disputes accuracy of certain billing transaction, please provide the figure of the correct bill for each of the Disputed Transactions.

#### 1. SBG RESPONSE:

Based upon a review of the information and documentation, Respondent has provided, to date, for Complainant(s) to respond to the question presented, SBG responds as follows: Nothwithstanding that PGW is subject to calculating customer billing statements in accordance with the PGW Gas Tariff 4.2, SBG submits that billing customers for CCF usage where the PGW statement of accounts as supplied to SBG (attached hereto and incorporated by reference) shows there was zero (0) CCF usage in the month(s) listed for Disputes, PGW' demand for payment is excessive and unwarranted and one of the many factors to be considered and listed and categorized as Dispute Transactions. In these instances, notwithstanding other breaches of the service contract, the bills for these months, where zero (0) CCF usage is incurred in the category SBG Dispute Code "A", the billed amounts for gas usage should be \$0. Attached hereto as "A" Disputed Transactions.

#### PGW Interrogatory/Request

2. Please provide all supporting documentation showing that each Disputed Transaction is incorrect and that the calculation of the correct bill in response to PGW's Request for Production of Documents and Interrogatories Set I, No. 1 is correct. Supporting documentation includes, but not limited to, any analyses of historic gas usage at service address of the Disputed transactions, the use of atmospheric and/or weather information in the comparison historic usage periods or any other information whatsoever that SBG considered in its determination that the Disputed Transactions were inaccurate and that SBG's determination of the each correct bill is accurate.

#### 2. SBG RESPONSE:

SBG does not admit or concede, and in general denies that PGW's bills for service, via its record keeping system, data collection practices and procedures, manual and/or automated meter reading system, financial accounting reporting, billing statements, accounting practices and application of payments either manually or under its automated system, customer service and dispute resolution methods procedures and practices, and along with all other manners of operations of its duty of providing good service are correct or in comportment with the laws of this Commonwealth as defined by the PGW Tariff, and Chapter 14 of Title 66 of Public Utility Code. It is SBG's position that the bills as issued are incorrect and have long been in Dispute and unresolved leading to the challenge of PGW's bills accuracy, correctness and/or validity as set forth in the Disputed Transactions. Attached please find the documentation upon which SBG relied in determining the inaccuracies of the PGW bills as proven by the statement of accounts and other information as supplied by PGW to SBG for review.

#### PGW Interrogatory/Request

3. For each separate Disputed Transaction, as defined in "Definitions and Instructions (1), above, that is based upon the allegation that the monthly usage and/or meter reading for the disputed transaction is incorrect and/or designated by SBG Dispute Code "J" (Disputed Meter Read) as defined the SBG Accounting Dispute Binder Code legend in Appendix 1, which is attached hereto, please provide SBG's calculation of the correct bill for each disputed



SEP. - 2 2014

transaction. That is, where SBG disputes accuracy of certain billing transactions, please provide the figure of the correct bill for each of the Disputed Transactions.

#### 3.SBG RESPONSE:

Despite SBG's request for production of meter history data, (See SBG Interrogatories & Requests for Production Interrogatory Set II, Question 25), for the dates of the Disputed Transactions listed in Appendix 1, PGW has not provided specific meter history data that confirms the accuracy of calibration and performance of the equipment used to read meters at the subject properties on the dates of the Disputed Transactions in question. Therefore, without having the information that is in PGW's possession, sole custody, and control that can verify the accuracy, calibration, and working order of the meters and without the information that can confirm the veracity of the radio frequency of the AMR collection equipment used to read the meters in question, SBG cannot determine the accuracy of the CCF usage data. Without having the correct information to input into a formula, it would be speculative for SBG to respond to this question. However, to the extent that PGW has provided to SBG, CCF usage data via the statement of accounts and SBG has been able to corroborate and assess its historical data information, SBG has compiled a chart showing historical CCF usage charts for the subject properties and weather analyses charts which are attached hereto. In response, SBG offers the following example of how certain CCF usage provided by PGW to SBG by way of its statement of accounts is implausible and indicative of an error that supports SBG's claims. By way of example, however, not limited to, see relevant details for account # ending in 3358 and 7092. Attached hereto as "J" Disputed Transactions.

#### PGW Interrogatory/Request

4. Please provide all supporting documentation showing that each Disputed Transaction is incorrect and that the calculation of the correct bill in response to PGW's Request for Production of Documents and Interrogatories Set I, No. 3 is correct. Supporting documentation includes, but it is not limited to, any analyses of historic gas usage at service address of the Disputed transactions, the use of atmospheric and/or weather information in the comparison historic usage periods or any other information whatsoever that SBG considered in its determination that the Disputed Transactions were inaccurate and that SBG's determination of the each correct bill is accurate.

#### 4. SBG RESPONSE:

See SBG Historical CCF Usage Charts and Weather Analyses Information attached hereto with "J" Disputed Transactions.

# PGW Interrogatory/Request

5. Please identify the preparer or preparers of all analyses contained in SBG's responses to PGW's Request for Production of Documents and Interrogatories Set I, Nos. 2 and 4.

#### 5. SBG RESPONSE:

Ms. Kathy Treadwell, SBG Management Services, Inc., Accountant

Mr. Artem Gumenyuk, SBG Management Services, Inc., Accountant

Mr. Eric Lampert, CPA, SBG Management Services. Inc., Accountant

#### PGW Interrogatory/Request

6. For each separate Disputed Transaction, defined in "Definitions and Instructions (1), above, that is based upon the allegation that the monthly usage and subsequent bills should have been issued to a tenant as designated by SBG Dispute Code "G" (Tenant Charges) as defined the SBG Accounting Dispute Binder Code legend in Appendix 1, which is attached hereto, please provide supporting documentation that a tenant lawfully occupied the service address for those Dispute Transactions and that the tenant applied for gas service.

#### 6. SBG RESPONSE:

Pursuant to the Philadelphia Gas Works Gas Service Tariff 2.1 – Application for Gas Service, and the Philadelphia Gas Works Gas Service Tariff 2.2 - Contracts for Gas Service. Contracts for gas service is in privity between the

applicant and the provider (PGW). Applications for service are in the sole care, custody and control of the applicant and the gas service provider. In its responses to SBG Interrogatories and Requests for Production for Documents,

Sets I, II & III, PGW has vociferously objected to SBG's request for such information and has refused to supply tenant account information and/or confirm tenant accounts at the subject properties and/or confirm gas usage, billing charges and confirm the accuracy of all billing statements of accounts and applications of payments, fees, charges, usage data and service charges for tenant accounts for the Disputed Transactions at the subject properties. We have reviewed SBG records and have confirmed that SBG has not applied for gas service in the name of any of the Tenants listed in the SBG Dispute Code "G" (Tenant Charges) as defined, by the SBG Accounting Dispute Binder Code legend in Appendix 1. In accordance with the Tariff, the contract for gas service is between the applying party and the service provider. However, in the spirit of cooperation, we can confirm that SBG has not applied for gas service at the subject properties in the name of the tenants of record at the subject properties. However, by admission , as confirmed by PGW responses in its letter dated August 8, 2014, addressed to ALJ Judge Vero, regarding SBG Account No. 7365806029, and the meters listed thereafter, there are at least 26 meters which are tenant accounts for which gas and service have been billed to a disputed SBG account. PGW has only recently confirmed and provided such information despite repeated requests. PGW has admitted it has provided proofs confirming the existence of tenant accounts comingled with SBG accounts for which SBG has made erroneous payments thereon or have been subjected to erroneous liens against its properties. Additional documentation setting forth further examples of PGW's proofs of appropriating tenant accounts and misapplying them to SBG customer of record accounts is attached hereto as "G" Disputed Transactions.

This response was prepared by Kathy Treadwell, Accountant, for SBG Management Services, Inc.

	VERIFICATION
	, verify that the responses, statements and documents foregoing document are true and correct. I understand that false statements made f 18 Pa.C.S.A.§ 4904 relating to unsworn falsification to authorities.
Date: 9/2/14	BY: KTM
	Name: K. Treadwell

Title: Accountant, SBG Management Services, Inc. For Complainants/SBG Management Services, Inc. et al.

RECEIVED

SEP -2 2014

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

į	Fedex. Package 8063 1205 4333	□21.5 = FedEx Copy
	Express US AIRDIII DOBU IL EUR TELES	4 Express Package Service - November - Packages as to State - November - Nove
	Prin   1  21)   Account Number   2373-0508-3	are diges Bosinists Day are server and the Business Days are server.
	Senter DDANA ROSS, ESQ More 219 938-6665	Processes (Indian properties with the delimental con- Missering actions (Latterfold Cod-may a primaries).
g	COTORN SEC MANAGEMENT	D1 Fields Priority Overhight  Aus manuscraper of Those districtions of the Australian Priority Children privary and the Australian Priority Children privary and the Australian Priority Children Priority Childre
<b>55</b>	Address 1095 RYDAL RD	05 FedEx Sprachard Descripts
1800.GofedEx 1800.463.3339	De RYDAL Same PA Ze 17046-1711	5 Packaging
Ž	2 Your Internal Billing Reference	06   fedix Envelope* 02   fedix Pal* 03   fedix 04   fedix 01   Odus
500	13 To Rechards Secretary Roscritary Clina vetti	6 Special Handling and Delivery Signature Options  OSTUDDAY DELIVERY
	DOMPHY PA PUC	(c) Signature Required  10 5 Signature 34 5 section and section of the section of
redex.com	Address Commonwealth Keystone Bldg 010	Dead this phipmanet contain desporant ground:  Dead this phipmanet contain desporant ground:  One to the phipmanet contain desporant ground:
<u>π</u>	Address 400 NOTH Street 31 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	Type 04() Yes amount   Yes amou
ļ	$1  \forall a \in C \in bando$	7 Payment Siller Diseases Commission
Ì	)	1 Serder Z Recipiert 3 Third Party 4 Credit Card 5 CastyCheck
	O 115759565	Finds Aug 10.  Total Performs  Total Performs  Total Declared Value*  Description
		The fields to benefit as particularly and a supplier of the field of t
	. 8063 1205 4333	And Date 2013 of the February Company Street or Principle Sq. U.S.A. (2004)
48		MUR3
00	Fedexx. Package Bobs 1205 4344	□215 km FedEx Copy
	From   Sanders FedEx   CORD   DESCRIPTION	4 Express Packago Servico - non motor material profession of 150 fbs.
	Deta (1/21) Account Number E373-0508-3	Nest Upinets Days
ļ		96   FedEr First Committee
<b>83</b>	COMPANY SRC MANAGEMENT	D1   FedEx Priority Cverreight   G3   FedEx 2Dyy   G4   FedEx 2Dyy
463.53	Address 1095 RYDAL (ID	05 Caffic Standard Overnight 20 Tadfic Excress Sever had been proceed to the several Sever had been proceed to the several Sever had been put maked to the several sev
88	DN RYDAL Sum PA 2P 19046-17)]	5 Packaging ***********************************
g Dego Dego	2 Your Internal Billing Reference	6. Special Hendling and Delivery Signature Options
1800,GofedEx 1,800,463,3339	Recipients Mr. Laureto Farires Esq.	_03□ SATURDAY DELIVERY
redex.com	Formany PGW- Law Department	No Spreams Required Processing to the state of the state
edex	Address 800 W. Montgomery Are 01 Containing the Con	Quest this adoption contain designment goods?
	MOLD Senantery  LI 4/1 F   DD Y  Address  10   Destroyee	The D4 The repetition of the control
	or Philadelphia sun PA 20 19122	7 Payment 881 ac   Description   Description   Description   Are 7 to
	E ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' '	1 Conder 2 Recipiers 3 Third Pany 4 Conde Card 5 Cath/Check
	LLAN ARMA ALAN ARMA ARMA ARMA BARA ARMA ARMA ARMA ARMA	Social Parchagess Total (Verter Total Declared Value" pure turnam
		And the first of the contract
	0003 1203 -344	PII
<u>ব</u> ⇔⊺		But Down (91) - Part Printing ( Gradua 1910 ) Printing in 12 to 1916
į	For Evy Package	An Day by the nation grade and hele retains a six six
į	Fedex. Package Express US Airbill 8063 1205 4355	Place Copy
į	Fedex Package " ADI 3 3 3 DE 113 E	DOIS from Federal Parkage Services - Americans Andrews
į	Fedex Package & DES 1205 4355	FedEx Copy    Express Package Service   Australian   Aust
į	Feder Package Express US Airbill From 92 14 Sweder Feds 2393-0508-3 Sander's DONN 2 ROSS ESQ Prom 215 938-6665	FedEx Copy    Suppose Package Service   Supp
00	Feder Package Express US Airbill From 9214 Senders Feder Account funder 2373-0508-3  Sender's DONNA ROSS ESG Proom 215 738-6669  Dempany SBG NANAGENIENT	THE STATE OF THE S
00	Feed Extract   Package   Express   US Airbill   8063 1205 4355   From   Package   2373-0508-3   Sandar's   DONN 2 ROSS   ESQ   Package   2373-0508-3   Express   Esq   Package   2373-0508-3   Esq   Package   2373-05	FedEx Copy    Express Package Service   Package and pa
00	Feder Package Express US Airbill From 9214 Senders Feder Account funder 2373-0508-3  Sender's DONNA ROSS ESG Proom 215 738-6669  Dempany SBG NANAGENIENT	FedEx Copy    Express Package Service   Package and pa
00	Feed Ext. Package Express US Airbill  From 92 14 Sender's Feets Account further 2373-0508-3  Sender's DOWN ROSS ESGT Prome 215 938-6665  Company SBG NANAGENENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Page 17046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference	Compared to the Compared Compared to the Com
00	Federal Package Express US Airbill  From 92 14 Senter Federal 2393-0508-3  Senter DOMA ROSS ESG Proces 215 938-6665  Company SBG NANAGERIENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Day RYDAL State PA 217 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 To Recipient ALT EYANAR Proce	Company   Comp
00	FECTOR PACKAGE EXPRESS US Airbill  In From 92 14 Sender's Fedor Account for Fedor England States  Sender's DOMMA ROSS ESG PROOF 215 938-6669  Company SBG MANAGERIENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Day RYDAL States PA 219 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 To Recipient's ALT EYANGA Prome  Company PA PUBLIC M-HILLY Commits SSIBIL	Pedex Copy
00	Express US Airbill  From 92 14 Senter Feets  Senter DOMN 2 ROSS ESG PROOF 215 938-6665  Company SBG NANAGEPIENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Day RYDAL Sharp PA 71 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 TO Rectainty ALT Express Phone  Company PA PUBLIC Militar Commissions  Rectainty ALT Express Phone  Rectainty ALT Express Phone	Pedex Copy
00	EXPLOSE US AIR DILL  From 912 14 Souder Forts Account Number 2393-0508-3  Souder Donne Ross Esq. Proof 215 938-6669  Company SBG MANAGEMENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Dy RYDAL South PA 217 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 To Recipients ALT Evanda Proof Name PA Public Mail they Commit Strey  Address Suite 4063  Modern Sui	Pedex Copy
1800.6x.com 1800.6xedix 1800.4x33339 O 45	Express US Airbill  From 92 14 Sender's Fedor Account former 2393-0508-3  Souther's DONN 2 ROSS ESG Proof 215 938-6669  Company SBG MANAGERIENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  Dy RYDAL State PA 28 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 To Recipient's ALT EYANAR  Company PA PUBLIC 11-11-12 Committee 15818 14  Address SUILE 4063  On 1000 Westerley  Address SUILE 4063	Pedex Copy
00	EXPLOSE PACKAGE EXPLOSE US AIR bill  In From Plan   2   14   Sender's Feetle Account Number 2393-0508-3  Sonder's DONN'S ROSS ESG PROOF 215 938-6669  Company SBG MANAGERIENT  Address 1095 RYDAL RD  PA RYDAL State PA 219 19046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  IS TO Recipient's ALT EYANG'S Prome  Company PA PUBLIC IN-HILLY COMMINISSIBIL  Address SUILE 4063  Prome State PA 2010 Weekley  Address SUILE 4063  On MAYKEL SAVEET  Address SUILE 4063  PA 2010 Weekley  AND ADDRESS SUILE AND	Pedex Copy
00	EXPLOSE US AIRBIT BOLD 1205 4355  In From Pre 9 2 14 South Forts Account Number 2373-0508-3  South Donne Ross Esq. Proof 215 738-6665  Company SBG MANAGEMENT  Address 1075 RYDAL RD  Cry RYDAL Som PA 719 17046-1711  2 Your Internal Billing Reference  13 To Recipient's ALT Evanda Proof Recipient P	Pedex Copy

# RECEIVED

SEP - 2 2014

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

## COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

### In the Matter of:

Re: Notice of Entry of Appearance

In the Matters of: SBG Management Services, Inc./Colonial Garden Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2304183; SBG Management Services, Inc./Fairmount Realty, v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2304215; SBG Management Services, Inc./Simon Gardens Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2304324; SBG Management Services, Inc./Elrae Garden Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2304167; SBG Management Services, Inc./Marshall Square Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2304303; SBG Management Services, Inc./Marchwood Realty v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308454; SBG Management Services, Inc./Simon Gardens Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308460; SBG Management Services, Inc./Oak Lane Realty Co., LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308465; and SBG Management Services, Inc./Colonial Garden Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308465; and SBG Management Services, Inc./Colonial Garden Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308465; and SBG Management Services, Inc./Colonial Garden Realty, LP v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. C-2012-2308469

#### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that as of today's date, I have served the foregoing Notice of Appearance, and Complainants' Responses to PGW's First Set of Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents served upon Complainant, SBG Management Services, Inc. in the above referenced matters, upon the parties set forth below, via First Class, U.S. mail/overnight delivery and/or by hand delivery to all parties as listed below, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa.Code Section 1.54 and the PA Public Utility Commission Orders.

The Honorable ALJ Eranda Vero Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, Suite 4063, 801 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107 For Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Via U.S. Mail First Class/overnight mail

Mr. Laureto Farinas, Esquire Philadelphia Gas Works 800 W. Montgomery Avenue, 4th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19122 For Respondent PGW
Via U.S. Mail First Class/overnight mail

For Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
Via U.S. Mail First Class/overnight mail

Mr. Phil Pulley and Ms. Kathy Treadwell SBG Management Services, Inc. P.O. Box 459, Abington, PA 19001

For Complainants
Via Hand Delivery

The Honorable Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265, Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

DONNA S. ROSS, ESQUIRE

SBG MANAGEMENT SERVICES, INC.

P.O. Box 549 Abington, PA 19001 Phone: 484-888-9578 Office: 215-938-6665 Facsimile: 215-938-7613

By:

Email: dsross@sbgmanagement.com; dsross90@gmail.com

Pennsylvania Attorney ID. No. 59747

RECEIVED

SER - 2 2014



MURS