



## DOCUMENT FOLDER

#### OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE

Suite 1102, Commerce Building 300 North Second Street Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101

William R. Lloyd, Jr. Small Business Advocate (717) 783-2525 (717) 783-2831 (FAX)

June 6, 2008

# RECEIVED

#### **E-MAIL AND HAND DELIVERY**

Hon. Susan D. Colwell Administrative Law Judge Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265 JUN - 9 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

I am delivering today the Notice of Appearance, on behalf of the Office of Small Business Advocate, in the above-captioned proceeding. This is in response to your Prehearing Order, dated May 21, 2008.

Two copies have been served today on all known parties in this proceeding. A Certificate of Service to that effect is enclosed.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Assistant Small Business Advocate

Attorney ID No. 77538

Enclosure

98 CELYEU 98 FIRE 97 C.A.L.J. 98 JUN -9 MI 7: 40 PA PUC

## BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal

Docket No. I-00040105

Service Fund

#### **NOTICE OF APPEARANCE**

The Office of Small Business Advocate, pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.24, hereby enters the appearance of Steven C. Gray, in the above-captioned proceeding.

Documents in this proceeding should now be served on the following:

Steven C. Gray
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North Second Street – Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
(717) 783-2831 (fax)
sgray@state.pa.us

Steven C. Gray

Small Business Advocate Attorney ID No. 77538

Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North Second Street – Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 783-2525 (717) 783-2831 (fax)

Dated: June 6, 2008

04 -9 74 7:40

## BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access

Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural

Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal

Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that I am serving two copies of the Notice of Appearance, on behalf of the Office of Small Business Advocate, by e-mail and first class mail (unless otherwise noted) upon the persons addressed below:

Hon. Susan D. Colwell Administrative Law Judge Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265 (717) 783-5452 (717) 787-0481 (fax) scolwell@state.pa.us

(E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire Embarq Pennsylvania 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 245-6346 (717) 236-1389 (fax) sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

Jennifer A. Duane, Esquire Sprint Communications Company, L.P. 401 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, Suite 400 Washington, DC 20004 (202) 585-1937 (202) 585-1894 (fax) jennifer.a.duane@mail.sprint.com

Daniel Clearfield, Esquire
Alan C. Kohler, Esquire
Wolf, Block, Schort & Solis-Cohen
213 Market St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor
P. O. Box 865
Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865
(717) 237-7160
(717) 237-7161 (fax)
dclearfield@wolfblock.com
akohler@wolfblock.com

Joel H. Cheskis, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5th FL Forum Place
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
(717) 783-7152 (fax)
jcheskis@paoca.org
(E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Robert V. Eckenrod, Esquire Office of Trial Staff Pa. Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105 (717) 787-1976 (717) 772-2677 (fax) roeckenrod@state.pa.us

(E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Michelle Painter, Esquire Painter Law Firm, PLLC 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 (703) 968-5936 (fax) painterlawfirm@verizon.net

John P. Povilaitis, Esquire
Matthew A. Totino, Esquire
Ryan, Russell, Ogden & Seltzer
Suite 101
800 North Third Street
Harrisburg, PA 17102-2025
(Qwest)
(717) 236-7714
(717) 236-7816 (fax)
jpovilaitis@ryanrussell.com
mtotino@ryanrussell.com

Jennifer M. Sultzaberger, Esquire Regina L. Matz, Esquire Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 (RTCC) (717) 255-7600 (717) 236-8278 (fax) Jms@thomaslonglaw.com matz@thomaslonglaw.com Nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire
Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire
Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C.
625 Central Avenue
Westfield, NJ 07090
(Omnipoint, T-Mobile, Nextel)
(908) 301-1211
(908) 301-1212 (fax)
bmstern@rothfelderstern.com
mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

Robert C. Barber, Esquire
Mark Keffer, Esquire
AT&T Communications of PA, Inc.
1120 20th Street, NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 457-2160 (rb)
(202) 457-3839 (mk)
(202) 664-9658 (fax)
rcbarber@att.com
mkeffer@att.com

Elizabeth Barnes ebarnes@state.pa.us (E-mail only)

Robert Marinko marinko@state.pa.us (E-mail only) Kristin L. Smith, Esquire Qwest Communications Corporation 1801 California St., 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver, CO 80202 (303) 383-6614 (303) 298-8197 (fax) kristin.smith@qwest.com

Susan M. Roach, Esquire
Drinker Biddle & Reath
One Logan Square
18th & Cherry Streets
Philadelphia, PA 19103-6996
(Cellco, Verizon Wireless, Cingular)
(215) 988-2715
(215) 988-2757 (fax)
susan.roach@dbr.com

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 32 Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 963-6068 (215) 563-2658 (fax) suzan.d.paiva@verizon.com

Dr. Robert Loube Rhoads and Sinon, LLC 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net

Thomas J. Sniscak, Esquire
Hawke McKeon Sniscak & Kennard
100 North Tenth Street
P.O. Box 1778
Harrisburg, PA 17105
(717) 236-1300
(717) 236-4841 (fax)
tjsniscak@hmsk-law.com

Brian A. Rankin, Esquire Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center - 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 286-7325 (215) 286-5039 (fax) brian rankin@comcast.com Garnet M. Goins, Esquire
Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire
Sprint Communications Company LP
2001 Edmund Halley Drive - Second Floor
Reston, VA 20191
(703) 433-4248
(703) 433-4142 (fax)
garnet.goins@sprint.com
benjamin.aron@sprint.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 N. Radnor Chester Road - Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 (610) 744-4148 (fax) carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 - East Tower Washington, DC 20005 (202) 408-6431 (202) 408-6399 (fax) (First class mail only) Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation 2001 Edmund Halley Drive Reston, VA 20919 (703) 592-7618 (730) 592-7404 (fax) (First class mail only)

Steven C. Gray

Assistant Small Business Advocate

Attorney ID No. 77538

Date: June 6, 2008





#### OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE

Suite 1102, Commerce Building 300 North Second Street Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101

William R. Lloyd, Jr. Small Business Advocate

June 11, 2008

(717) 783-2525 (717) 783-2831 (FAX)

## RECEIVED

JUN 1 1 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

E-mail and Hand Delivery

Hon. Susan D. Colwell Administrative Law Judge Pa. Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105 DOCUMENT FOLDER

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

Enclosed are two copies of the Prehearing Memorandum on behalf of the Office of Small Business Advocate.

As evidenced by the enclosed certificate of service, all parties have been served as indicated.

Sincerely.

Steven C. Gray

Assistant Small Business Advocate

Attorney ID No. 77538

**Enclosures** 

cc: James J. McNulty, Secretary

Parties of Record Allen G. Buckalew

BTL

# BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access :

Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural :

Docket No. I-00040105

Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal

Service Fund

# OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE PREHEARING MEMORANDUM

#### I. INTRODUCTION

The Office of Small Business Advocate ("OSBA") is authorized to represent the interests of small business consumers of utility services before the Pennsylvania Public Utility

Commission ("Commission") pursuant to the provisions of the Small Business Advocate Act,

Act 181 of 1988, 73 P.S. §§ 399.41 - 399.50 ("the Act"). In order to discharge this statutory

duty, the Small Business Advocate deems it necessary to participate as a party to this proceeding.

Representing the OSBA in this matter is Assistant Small Business Advocate Steven C. Gray.

Please address all correspondence as follows:

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101
(717) 783-2525
(717) 783-2831 (fax)
sgray@state.pa.us

#### II. FILING BACKGROUND

On April 24, 2008, the Commission reopened the *Investigation Regarding Intrastate*Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal

Service Fund, at Docket No. I-0004010. The Commission referred a series of issues to the

Office of Administrative Law Judge for hearings and the preparation of a recommended decision by April 24, 2009.

On May 21, 2008, Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") Susan D. Colwell issued her Prehearing Order, setting forth, among other topics, the issues to be addressed in this proceeding.

#### III. <u>IDENTIFICATION OF THE OSBA WITNESS</u>

Assisting in the development and presentation of the OSBA's case in this proceeding will be:

Mr. Allen Buckalew
J.W. Wilson & Associates, Inc.
Rosslyn Plaza C - Suite 1104
1601 North Kent Street
Arlington, VA 22209
(703) 243-1049
(703) 243-3389 (fax)
abuca@aol.com

#### IV. IDENTIFICATION OF ISSUES

The Commission's April 24<sup>th</sup> Order and ALJ Colwell's May 21<sup>st</sup> Prehearing Order summarized the issues that are to be addressed by this proceeding. The OSBA does not propose any additions at this time. The OSBA reserves the right to pursue additional issues as they arise throughout the proceeding.

As appropriate and necessary, the OSBA will investigate and analyze the claims and proposals of the other parties through discovery, through the cross-examination of witnesses appearing for those parties, and through briefing. The OSBA will particularly focus on any issue where the impact on the interests of small business consumers would be unjustifiably different than, or disproportionate to, the impact on another class of customers, or otherwise lacking in reasonableness or basic fairness.

#### V. SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS

The OSBA requests that all parties serve a hard copy of any document filed in this case upon the OSBA and the OSBA witness identified above. In addition to hard copies of pleadings, briefs, and exceptions, the OSBA requests hard copies of responses to discovery propounded by the OSBA or any other party. The OSBA also requests that all parties serve an electronic copy of all interrogatory responses upon the OSBA and the OSBA witness identified above.

#### VI. <u>SETTLEMENT</u>

The OSBA notes its willingness to enter into settlement discussions at the appropriate phase of this proceeding.

#### VII. HEARING AND BRIEFING SCHEDULE

The procedural schedule proposed by ALJ Colwell is acceptable to the OSBA. Given the Governor's desire to limit the travel of State Offices under his jurisdiction, the OSBA respectfully requests that the evidentiary hearings take place in Harrisburg.

Respectfully submitted,

Steven C. Gray

Attorney ID No. 77538

Assistant Small Business Advocate

For:

William R. Lloyd, Jr. Attorney ID No. 16452 Small Business Advocate

Office of Small Business Advocate Suite 1102, Commerce Building 300 North Second Street Harrisburg, PA 17101

Dated: June 11, 2008

#### **BEFORE THE** PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access

Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural

Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal

Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that I am serving two copies of the Prehearing Memorandum, on behalf of the Office of Small Business Advocate, by e-mail and first class mail (unless otherwise noted) upon the persons addressed helow:

Hon, Susan D. Colwell Administrative Law Judge Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265 (717) 783-5452 (717) 787-0481 (fax) scolwell@state.pa.us

(E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire Embarq Pennsylvania 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 245-6346 (717) 236-1389 (fax) sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

Jennifer A. Duane, Esquire Sprint Communications Company, L.P. 401 9th Street, NW, Suite 400 Washington, DC 20004 (202) 585-1937 (202) 585-1894 (fax) jennifer.a.duane@mail.sprint.com

Daniel Clearfield, Esquire Alan C. Kohler, Esquire Wolf, Block, Schorr & Solis-Cohen 213 Market St., 9th Floor P. O. Box 865 Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865 (717) 237-7160 (717) 237-7161 (fax) dclearfield@wolfblock.com akohler@wolfblock.com

Joel H. Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th FL Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 (717) 783-7152 (fax) jcheskis@paoca.org

(E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Robert V. Eckenrod, Esquire Office of Trial Staff Pa. Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105 (717) 787-1976 (717) 772-2677 (fax) roeckenrod@state.pa.us (E-mail and Hand Delivery)

Michelle Painter, Esquire Painter Law Firm, PLLC 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 (703) 968-5936 (fax) painterlawfirm@verizon.net

John P. Povilaitis, Esquire Matthew A. Totino, Esquire Ryan, Russell, Ogden & Seltzer Suite 101 800 North Third Street Harrisburg, PA 17102-2025 (Owest) (717) 236-7714 (717) 236-7816 (fax) jpovilaitis@ryanrussell.com mtotino@ryanrussell.com

Jennifer M. Sultzaberger, Esquire Regina L. Matz, Esquire Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 (RTCC) (717) 255-7600 (717) 236-8278 (fax) Jms@thomaslonglaw.com matz@thomaslonglaw.com Nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (Omnipoint, T-Mobile, Nextel) (908) 301-1211 (908) 301-1212 (fax) bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Robert C. Barber, Esquire
Mark Keffer, Esquire
AT&T Communications of PA, Inc.
1120 20th Street, NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 457-2160 (rb)
(202) 457-3839 (mk)
(202) 664-9658 (fax)
rcbarber@att.com
mkeffer@att.com

Elizabeth Barnes ebarnes@state.pa.us (E-mail only)

Robert Marinko <u>rmarinko@state.pa.us</u> (E-mail only) Kristin L. Smith, Esquire Qwest Communications Corporation 1801 California St., 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver, CO 80202 (303) 383-6614 (303) 298-8197 (fax) kristin.smith@qwest.com

Susan M. Roach, Esquire
Drinker Biddle & Reath
One Logan Square
18th & Cherry Streets
Philadelphia, PA 19103-6996
(Cellco, Verizon Wireless, Cingular)
(215) 988-2715
(215) 988-2757 (fax)
susan.roach@dbr.com

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Leigh A. Hyer, Esquire Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755 (215) 563-2658 (fax) suzan.d.paiva@verizon.com leigh.a.hyer@verizon.com

Dr. Robert Loube Rhoads and Sinon, LLC 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net

Thomas J. Sniscak, Esquire
Hawke McKeon Sniscak & Kennard
100 North Tenth Street
P.O. Box 1778
Harrisburg, PA 17105
(717) 236-1300
(717) 236-4841 (fax)
tjsniscak@hmsk-law.com

Brian A. Rankin, Esquire Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center - 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 286-7325 (215) 286-5039 (fax) brian rankin@comcast.com Garnet M. Goins, Esquire
Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire
Sprint Communications Company LP
2001 Edmund Halley Drive - Second Floor
Reston, VA 20191
(703) 433-4248
(703) 433-4142 (fax)
garnet\_goins@sprint.com
benjamin.aron@sprint.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 N. Radnor Chester Road - Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 (610) 977-0043 (fax) carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 - East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 408-6431
(202) 408-6399 (fax)
jcalkins@sonnenschein.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation 2001 Edmund Halley Drive Reston, VA 20919 (703) 592-7618 (730) 592-7404 (fax) (First class mail only)

Pamela C. Polacek, Esquire Shelby A. Linton-Keddie, Esquire McNees Wallace & Nurick, LLC 100 Pine Street P. O. Box 1166 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 (717) 260-1763 (fax) ppolacek@mwn.com skeddie@mwn.com

Steven C. Gray

Assistant Small Business Advocate

Attorney ID No. 77538

Date: June 11, 2008

#### **CUMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA**







OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 800-684-6560 (in PA only)

FAX (717) 783-7152 consumer@paoca.org

IRWINA. POPOWSKY Consumer Advocate

PECEIVED

JUN 1 6 2008

Norman J. Kennard Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

DOCUMENT FOLDER

RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access
Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural
Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal
Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Norm:

Enclosed you will find two copies of the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set I, in the above-referenced proceeding.

In accordance with the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, we request that the Company provide verified answers to these inquiries within fifteen (15) days of service. Also, please forward the verified answers as they are completed, rather than waiting until-the responses to the full set are completed. We would appreciate it if you would communicate any objections you may have to these interrogatories as soon as possible.

We also request that you send a copy of the answers directly to our consultant, as listed below:

Bob Loube 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net If you have any questions, please call us. By copy of this letter, copies of these interrogatories have been served upon all parties. A certificate of service showing service of these interrogatories on all parties has been filed with Secretary McNulty of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission as required by 52 Pa. Code §5.341(b).

Sincerely,

Joel H Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney I.D. #81617

#### **Enclosures**

cc:

Parties of Record

James J. McNulty (Certificate of Service Only)

100667

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural

Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document, Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set I, upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 16<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2008.

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

Robert V. Eckenrod, Esq. Office of Trial Staff Pa. PUC Commonwealth Keystone Bldg. 400 North Street Harrisburg, PA 17105

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAID

Steven C. Gray, Esq., Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North Second Street Suite 1102 Commerce Bldg. Harrisburg, PA 17101

Norman J. Kennard, Esq. Regina L. Matz, Esq. Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esq. 240 North Third Street Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter, Esq. Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030

Bradford M. Stern, Esq. Martin C. RothFelder, Esq. Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, N.J. 07090 Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Leigh A. Hyer, Esq. Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esq. 150 North Radnor Chester Rd. Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

John J. Calkins, Esq.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005

Joel H. Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate

PA Attorney ID# 81617 jcheskis@paoca.org

Counsel for

Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 \*82775

# OALJ Hearing Report

			Please Uni	ack Tuose Riod	KS YVNICH AI	эріу
Docket No.:	I-00040105, et al.				YES	NO
			Prehearing Held	:	M	
Case Name:	Investigation Rega	rding Intrastate Access	Hearing Held:		<b>U</b>	
Charges IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the			Testimony Take	Testimony Taken:		
Pennsylvania Univ	versal Service Fund	<del></del>	Transcript Due:	Transcript Due:		
			Hearing Concluded:			
Location:	Harrisburg		Further Hearing Needed:			
			Estimated Add'l Days:		4	-
Date:	Wednesday, June	18, 2008			- /	
			RECORD CLOS	ED:		U
ALJ:	Susan D. Colwell		DA			
			Briefs to be Filed	j;		
Reporting Firm:	Commonwealth Re	eporting		DATE:	,	
	·		Bench Decision:			
	BUREAU		REMARKS:	PAGE	1 of	a
<u>.</u> <u></u>	URI		SCHEOULI		ER TO	BE
RECENTE	PUC Y'S E		ISSUE			
	주요 ~ >				-	
	+ <u></u>	FARIN In a second to the form of				
	ephone Number	EARLY - Incomplete Information Address			g. you represen	ting?
Traine apg Ter	epimile Rumber			villo alc	> O	ding:
		Juite 1102 Com	IMPRE Bldg		(R/R)	1
TEVEN	ORAN.	300 N. Sec	and A		123	<del></del>
		City (-	State Zip			
Telephone:	1-i00 200 cm	F-mail Address:	( Tt)	Fax Number:	6: 170	2 2 02/
Totophono.7	7-1783-2525	E-mail Address:	STATE PAIUS	- ax rumbur	7/7-1-1-18	3- <u>24</u>
John D	) odgl	1	1 NW#200		h	
Q ON ( )	967	City ,	State Zip	l con	ncast	
		Washinghan	20006		•	
Telephone: 202	.973.4205	E-mail Address: John de	odge @dwt.com	Fax Number:	202.9	73.4499
		Ilanika Cultantarea			-	Ass'v
Norman	Ken nav Cons	217 COCUSE )	reel, Suito Soc		•	
Momes 6	ng Niese	Harris by	State Zip	Ruzl	Telign Corli	e_
Tolophana	Transad	<del>  -                                    </del>	H 17101	Fax Number:	Cirla	<u>~</u>
Telephone: 717/			do homes			<del></del>
Check this box if additional parties or attendees appear on back of form.						
Reporter's Signature						
			~ red	めいせいち ろだけばだし	I E	

Note: Completion of this form does not constitute an entry of appearance, see 52 Pa. Code §§1.24 and 1.25.

Name and Telephone Number	Address		Who are you representing?	
ALE BENEDER EMBALO PA 240 N. 310 St., Suit-201 HAUSLIGO, PA 17101	City	State	Zip	United Telephone of Port
Telephone: 277-245-6346	E-mail Address: Bue. e.	benede	k Cembr	Fax Number: 717-236-1389
Suzan Paiva	1717 Arch			Veri200
	Philadelphia	State PA	Zip 19103	
Telephone: 215-466-4755	E-mail Address: 50 2002	.d.paiv	a@ Vecizin	Fax Number: 215-563-2658
Shelby Linton- Keddie	100 Pine St P.O. Box 1166	r	1000	Broadbond Colde Association of
Pamela Polacek	1+6g	State	Zip 17101-1166	("BLAT")
Telephone: 717 -232 -8000	E-mail Address: PPu	cesse	NWN. COM	Fax Number: 717-237-5300
BRADFORD M. STERN OTHFS WELL STERN, LLC 25 CSDTRAL LYES NT	busterne rot	th Felch	ersternica Zip	-MOBILE
Telephone: 508-7-01-08063	E-mail Address:		<u> </u>	Fax Number:
Ben Aron 2001 Edmund Halley Dr.	Spar	State	Zip	Sprint
Reston, VA 20191/ Telephone:	E-mail Address: ), (2)	<u> </u>	, cron Po (	Fax Number: 703 542 7407
Michelle Painter	13017 Dun hill	,	-401 FO J	ATT Comm. 9 PA
	- City Facifax	State VA	Zip 22030	TCG NS TCG PIH.
Telephone: 703 201 837 8	E-mail Address: paunte	vlawfir	Marzonne	Fax Number: 703 968 59 36
Shellydian				
	City	State	Zip	
Telephone:	E-mail Address:		<u>.                                    </u>	Fax Number:
	City	State	Zip	
Telephone:	E-mail Address:	<del></del>	<u>L</u> .	Fax Number:

#### COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA



#### OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 800-684-6560 (in PA only) DOCUMENT FOLDER

FAX (717) 783-7152 consumer@paoca.org

IRWINA. POPOWSKY Consumer Advocate

June 23, 2008

RECEIVED

JUN 2 3 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COUNTY OF SECRETARY'S BURLLAU

Norman J. Kennard Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108

RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access

Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal

Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Norm:

Enclosed you will find two copies of the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set II, in the above-referenced proceeding.

In accordance with the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, we request that the Company provide verified answers to these inquiries within fifteen (15) days of service. Also, please forward the verified answers as they are completed, rather than waiting until the responses to the full set are completed. We would appreciate it if you would communicate any objections you may have to these interrogatories as soon as possible.

We also request that you send a copy of the answers directly to our consultant, as listed below:

Roger D. Colton Fisher, Sheehan & Colton 34 Warwick Road Belmont, MA 02478 Rcolton.fsc@comcast.net If you have any questions, please call us. By copy of this letter, copies of these interrogatories have been served upon all parties. A certificate of service showing service of these interrogatories on all parties has been filed with Secretary McNulty of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission as required by 52 Pa. Code §5.341(b).

Sincerely,

Joel A. Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney I.D. #81617

Enclosures

cc: Parties of Record

James J. McNulty (Certificate of Service Only)

100667

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund
Docket No. I-00040105

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document, Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set II, upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 23rd day of June, 2008.

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

Robert V. Eckenrod, Esq.
Office of Trial Staff
Pa. PUC
Commonwealth Keystone Bldg.
400 North Street
Harrisburg, PA 17105

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAID

Steven C. Gray, Esq.,
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North Second Street
Suite 1102 Commerce Bldg.
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Norman J. Kennard, Esq. Regina L. Matz, Esq. Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esq. 240 North Third Street Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter, Esq. Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030

Bradford M. Stern, Esq. Martin C. RothFelder, Esq. Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, N.J. 07090 Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Leigh A. Hyer, Esq. Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esq. 150 North Radnor Chester Rd. Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

John J. Calkins, Esq.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005

Angela Hart-Davis, Esq.
John C. Dodge, Esq.
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006

Brian A. Rankin Vice President, Deputy General Counsel Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center, 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

Deanne M. O'Dell, Esq. WolfBlock, LLP 213 Market St., 9<sup>th</sup> Fl. P.O. Box 865 Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865 Joel A. Cheskis Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney ID# 81617

jcheskis@paoca.org

Counsel for Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 \*82775

melhants

Suzan DeBusk Paiva Assistant General Counsel Pennsylvania



1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tel: (215) 466-4755 Fax: (215) 563-2658 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

July 1, 2008

#### VIA UPS OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Zsuzanna Benedek, Esquire Embarq Corporation 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Ms. Benedek:

Enclosed please find the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests to the United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania, propounded by Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc., Verizon North Inc. and MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services, LLC, in the above-referenced matter.

Do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

DOCUMENT FOLDER

Respectfully,

Suzan D. Paiva

SDP/slb Enclosure

RECEIVED

JUL 01 2008

Via E-Mail and UPS Delivery

cc: Certificate of Service

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Via UPS Delivery

cc: Secretary James J. McNulty (cover letter and certificate only)
The Honorable Susan Colwell (cover letter and certificate only)

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests to the United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania, upon the participants listed below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code Section 1.54 (related to service by a participant) and 1.55 (related to service upon attorneys).

Dated at Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, this 1st day of July, 2008.

#### **VIA E-MAIL AND UPS DELIVERY**

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Regina L. Matz, Esquire Jennifer M. Sultzaberter Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 Rural Telephone Company Coalition

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire
Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C.
625 Central Avenue
Westfield, NJ 07090
Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile; Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile and Voicestream
Pittsburgh LP d/b/a T-Mobile Nextel
Communications, Inc.

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 Cingular Wireless LLC Cellco Parthership d/b/a Verizon Wireless

John C. Dodge, Esquire
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
Comcast Digital Phone and Comcast
Business Communications, LLC

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Barrett Sheridan, Esquire Christy Appleby, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

Zsuzanna Benedek, Esquire Embarq Corporation 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Steven C. Gray, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> St, Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter
Painter Law Firm, PLLC
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
AT&T Communications of PA, LLC,
TCG Pittsburgh and TCG New Jersey

Pamela C. Polacek, Esquire Shelby A. Linton-Keddie, Esquire McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 Broadband Cable Association of PA JOT 01 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU John J. Calkins, Esquire Douglas Bonner, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005

Suzan D. Paiva

Pennsylvania Bar ID No. 53853 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755

Attorney for
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North Inc.
MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC
d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services

Suzan DeBusk Paiva Assistant General Counsel Pennsylvania



1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tel: (215) 466-4755 Fax: (215) 563-2658 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

July 1, 2008

#### VIA UPS OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108

DOCUMENT FOLDER

RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Kennard:

Enclosed please find the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests to Each Rural Incumbent Local Exchange Carrier Represented by the Pennsylvania Telephone Association, propounded by Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc., Verizon North Inc. and MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services, LLC, in the above-referenced matter.

Do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Respectfully,

Suzan D. Paiva

SDP/slb Enclosure RECEIVED

JUL 01 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Via E-Mail and UPS Delivery

cc: Certificate of Service

Via UPS Delivery

cc: Secretary James J. McNulty (cover letter and certificate only)
The Honorable Susan Colwell (cover letter and certificate only)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests to Each Rural Incumbent Local Exchange Carrier Represented by the Pennsylvania Telephone Association, upon the participants listed below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code Section 1.54 (related to service by a participant) and 1.55 (related to service upon attorneys).

Dated at Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, this 1st day of July, 2008.

#### VIA E-MAIL AND UPS DELIVERY

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Regina L. Matz, Esquire Jennifer M. Sultzaberter Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 Rural Telephone Company Coalition

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile; Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile and Voicestream Pittsburgh LP d/b/a T-Mobile Nextel

Communications, Inc.

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 Cingular Wireless LLC Cellco Parthership d/b/a Verizon Wireless

John C. Dodge, Esquire
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
Comcast Digital Phone and Comcast
Business Communications, LLC

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Barrett Sheridan, Esquire Christy Appleby, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

Zsuzanna Benedek, Esquire Embarq Corporation 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Steven C. Gray, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> St, Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter
Painter Law Firm, PLLC
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
AT&T Communications of PA, LLC,
TCG Pittsburgh and TCG New Jersey

Pamela C. Polacek, Esquire Shelby A. Linton-Keddie, Esquire McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 Broadband Cable Association of PA RECEIVED

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU John J. Calkins, Esquire Douglas Bonner, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005

Suzan D. Pai

Pennsylvania Bar ID No. 53853 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755

Attorney for
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North Inc.
MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC
d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services



NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

July 7, 2008

DOCUMENT FOLDER

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and Intra LATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund; Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Michieskis:

Enclosed please find the Answers of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories - Set I. Due to the voluminous nature of the documents, the answers will only be provided in electronic format to the other parties.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

By:

Norman JaKennard

NJK:tit enclosure

CC:

Per Certificate of Service

James J. McNulty, Secretary (w/o enclosure)

Hon. Susan D. Colwell (w/o enclosure)

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

7000 7AF -1 LW 3: 11

- MEGEN

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 7<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true and correct

copy of the foregoing document upon the persons listed below via electronic mail:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
jcheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 East Tower Washington, DC 20005 (212) 408-6432 icalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (908) 301-1211 mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan Debusk Paiva
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North
1717 Arch Street, 10W
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 466-4755
Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire
The United Telephone Company of PA
LLC
d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania
240 North Third Street
Suite 201
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 236-1385
sue.e.benedek@embarg.com

Norman J. Kennard PA Attorney ID No. 29921 Voice Data Internet Wireless Entertainment



Embarq Corporation 240 N. 3rd Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 EMBARQ.com

DORIGINAL

July 7, 2008

#### **VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL**

Joel H, Cheskis, Assistant Consumer Advocate Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 DOCUMENT FOLDER

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Cheskis:

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania, enclosed please find an original and two (2) copies of Embarq Pennsylvania's Responses to Set I Interrogatories propounded by the Office of Consumer Advocate.

A copy has been sent to your consultant, Mr. Bob Loube via electronic and first-class mail.

By you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely

Sue Benedek

Attorney ID No. 60451

ZEB/jh

cc:

James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

Mr. Bob Loube (via electronic and first-class mail)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek

SENIOR COUNSEL

Voice: (717) 245-6346 Fax: (717) 236-1389

# BEFORE THE FOLDER

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	) ) )	Docket No. I-00040105

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 7<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Responses were served upon the persons below, via first-class mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: icheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire
Painter Law Firm
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire
McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108
e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com John Dodge, Esquire
Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted.

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire

Attorney ID No. 60451

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania

240 North Third Street, Suite 201

Harrisburg, PA 17101

Direct Phone: (717) 245-6346

Fax: (717) 236-1389

E-Mail: sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

2008 JUL -7 PM 2: 54

HEOMING -



NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

# DOCUMENT FOLDER

July 8, 2008

RECEIVED

JUL 08 2008

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and Intra LATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund; Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Greskis:

Enclosed please find the Answers of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories - Set II.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

By:

y: /

Mornan J. Kennard

NJK:tlt enclosure

CC:

Per Certificate of Service

James J. McNulty, Secretary (w/o enclosure)

Hon. Susan D. Colwell (w/o enclosure)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 8<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true and correct copy of the foregoing document upon the persons listed below by first class mail, postage prepaid:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
jcheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq.
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
P.O. Box 1166
100 Pine Street
Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166
(717) 232-8000
PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa
CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C.
150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200
Radnor, PA 19087-5245
(610) 977-2001
carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(212) 408-6432
jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (908) 301-1211 mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

RECEIVED

JUL 0.8 2008

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan Debusk Paiva
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North
1717 Arch Street, 10W
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 466-4755
Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire
The United Telephone Company of PA
LLC
d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania
240 North Third Street
Suite 201
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 236-1385
sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

Normand J. Kennard A Attorney ID No. 29921

#### COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA







OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 800-684-6560 (in PA only)

FAX (717) 783-7152 consumer@paoca.org

July 9, 2008

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esq. 240 North Third Street Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

ORIGINAL

DOCUMENT FOLDER RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access
Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural
Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal
Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Sue:

IRWINA. POPOWSKY

Consumer Advocate

Enclosed you will find two copies of the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set III Directed to Embarq, in the above-referenced proceeding.

In accordance with the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, we request that the Company provide verified answers to these inquiries within fifteen (15) days of service. Also, please forward the verified answers as they are completed, rather than waiting until the responses to the full set are completed. We would appreciate it if you would communicate any objections you may have to these interrogatories as soon as possible.

We also request that you send a copy of the answers directly to our consultant, as listed below:

Bob Loube 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net

SECRETARY'S OFFICE

Mulli -q pu o.

If you have any questions, please call us. By copy of this letter, copies of these interrogatories have been served upon all parties. A certificate of service showing service of these interrogatories on all parties has been filed with Secretary McNulty of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission as required by 52 Pa. Code §5.341(b).

Sincerely,

Joel H. Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate

PA Attorney I.D. #81617

Enclosures

cc: Parties of Record

James J. McNulty (Certificate of Service Only)

101329

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

<u>ဂ</u> က

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document. Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set III Directed to Embarg Corp., upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 9th day of July, 2008.

### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

TARY'S SERVICE BY E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAIR

ay, Esq.,
all Business Advocate
cond Street
mmerce Bldg.
17101

nard, Esc. Robert V. Eckenrod, Esq. Office of Trial Staff Pa. PUC Commonwealth Keystone Bldg. 400 North Street Harrisburg, PA 17105

Steven C. Gray, Esq., Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North Second Street Suite 1102 Commerce Bldg. Harrisburg, PA 17101

Norman J. Kennard, Esq. Regina L. Matz, Esq. Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500

Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030

Bradford M. Stern, Esq. Martin C. RothFelder, Esq. Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, N.J. 07090

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Leigh A. Hyer, Esq. Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esq. 150 North Radnor Chester Rd. Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

John J. Calkins, Esq.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005

Angela Hart-Davis, Esq.
John C. Dodge, Esq.
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006

Brian A. Rankin Vice President, Deputy General Counsel Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center, 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

Deanne M. O'Dell, Esq. WolfBlock, LLP 213 Market St., 9<sup>th</sup> Fl. P.O. Box 865 Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865 Joel H. Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney ID# 81617 jcheskis@paoca.org

Counsel for Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 \*82775

#### **COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA**







OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 800-684-6560 (in PA only)

FAX (717) 783-7152 consumer@paoca.org

July 9, 2008

Norman J. Kennard Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 ORIGINAL

DOCUMENT FOLDER RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access
Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural
Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal
Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Norm:

IRWINA POPOWSKY

Consumer Advocate

Enclosed you will find two copies of the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set III, in the above-referenced proceeding.

In accordance with the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, we request that the Company provide verified answers to these inquiries within fifteen (15) days of service. Also, please forward the verified answers as they are completed, rather than waiting until the responses to the full set are completed. We would appreciate it if you would communicate any objections you may have to these interrogatories as soon as possible.

We also request that you send a copy of the answers directly to our consultant, as listed below:

Bob Loube 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net SECRETARY'S BUBLA

968 JUL -9 PH 3: 5L

If you have any questions, please call us. By copy of this letter, copies of these interrogatories have been served upon all parties. A certificate of service showing service of these interrogatories on all parties has been filed with Secretary McNulty of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission as required by 52 Pa. Code §5.341(b).

Sincerely,

Joel M Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Artorney I.D. #81617

**Enclosures** 

cc:

Parties of Record

James J. McNulty (Certificate of Service Only)

100667

SECRETARY'S PURFAIT

2018 JUL -9 PH 3:55

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural

Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund

Docket No. I-00040105

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document, Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set III, upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 9th day of July, 2008.

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

Eckenrod, Esq.
rial Staff
ealth Keystone Bldg.
Street
PA 17105

SERVICE BY E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL, POSTAGE PREPARD Robert V. Eckenrod, Esq. Office of Trial Staff Pa. PUC Commonwealth Keystone Bldg. 400 North Street Harrisburg, PA 17105

ငှာ

Steven C. Gray, Esq., Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North Second Street Suite 1102 Commerce Bldg. Harrisburg, PA 17101

Norman J. Kennard, Esq. Regina L. Matz, Esq. Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esq. 240 North Third Street Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter, Esq. Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030

Bradford M. Stern, Esq. Martin C. RothFelder, Esq. Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, N.J. 07090

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Leigh A. Hyer, Esq. Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esq. 150 North Radnor Chester Rd. Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

John J. Calkins, Esq.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005

Angela Hart-Davis, Esq.
John C. Dodge, Esq.
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006

Brian A. Rankin Vice President, Deputy General Counsel Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center, 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

Deanne M. O'Dell, Esq. WolfBlock, LLP 213 Market St., 9<sup>th</sup> Fl. P.O. Box 865 Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865 Joel H. Cheskis
Assistant Consumer Advocate
PA Attorney ID# 81617
jcheskis@paoca.org

Counsel for Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 \*82775



July 14, 2008

#### **VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL**

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc. 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

DOCUMENT

**FOLDER** 

Dear Ms. Paiva,

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC *d/b/a* Embarq Pennsylvania, enclosed please find Embarq Pennsylvania's Objections to Set I Interrogatories propounded by Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc., Verizon North Inc. and MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC *d/b/a* Verizon Access Transmission Services, LLC., (collectively "Verizon").

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Joseph Stewart

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

JRS/jh

cc:

James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Joseph R. Stewart Senior Counsel 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 220-8625 (phone) (614) 224-3902 (fax)

## BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

	)	
Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and	)	
IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the	)	Docket No. I-00040105
Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	)	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	)	

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 14<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Objections were served upon the persons below, via first-class mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire
McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108
e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com John Dodge, Esquire Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted,

Joseph R! Stewart, Esquire Admitted Pro Hac Vice

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Direct Phone: (614) 220-8625

Fax: (614) 224-3902

E-mail: joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com



**DOCUMENT** 

July 14, 2008

#### VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Joel H. Cheskis, Assistant Consumer Advocate Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

> Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania

> Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Cheskis:

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC d/b/a Embarg Pennsylvania, enclosed please find an original and two (2) copies of Embarg Pennsylvania's Responses to Set II Interrogatories propounded by the Office of Consumer Advocate.

A copy has been sent to your consultant, Mr. Roger Colton via electronic and first-class mail.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

JRS/jh

cc: James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

Mr. Roger Colton (via electronic and first-class mail)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Joseph R. Stewart Senior Counsel 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 220-8625 (phone) (614) 224-3902 (fax)

Stewart SH

## BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	) ) )	Docket No. 1-00040105	3:26
•	)	Docket No. 1-00040105	

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 14<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Responses were served upon the persons below, via first-class mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire
Painter Law Firm
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire
McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108
e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, NW

Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com John Dodge, Esquire Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted,

Joseph R. Stewart, Esquire Admitted Pro Hac Vice

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

Heist / My

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600

Columbus, Ohio 43215 Direct Phone: (614) 220-8625

Fax: (614) 224-3902

E-mail: joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com









#### OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 800-684-6560 (in PA only)

FAX (717) 783-7152 consumer@paoca.org

July 17, 2008

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103



RE:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Suzan:

IRWINA, POPOWSKY

Consumer Advocate

Enclosed you will find two copies of the Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set I Directed to Verizon Pennsylvania, in the above-referenced proceeding.

In accordance with the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, we request that the Company provide verified answers to these inquiries within fifteen (15) days of service. Also, please forward the verified answers as they are completed, rather than waiting until the responses to the full set are completed. We would appreciate it if you would communicate any objections you may have to these interrogatories as soon as possible.

We also request that you send a copy of the answers directly to our consultant, as listed below:

Bob Loube 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901 (301) 681-0338 bobloube@earthlink.net

SECRETARY SECTION 3: 35

If you have any questions, please call us. By copy of this letter, copies of these interrogatories have been served upon all parties. A certificate of service showing service of these interrogatories on all parties has been filed with Secretary McNulty of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission as required by 52 Pa. Code §5.341(b).

Sincerely,

Joel H. Cheskis

Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney I.D. #81617

**Enclosures** 

cc: P

Parties of Record

James J. McNulty (Certificate of Service Only)

101677

HABRIDE STABNIBADES OBJEKT

2000

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund
Docket No. I-00040105

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document, Office of Consumer Advocate's Interrogatories, Set I Directed to Verizon Pennsylvania, upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 17th day of July, 2008.

#### SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

Robert V. Eckenrod, Esq.
Office of Trial Staff
Pa. PUC
Commonwealth Keystone Bldg.
400 North Street
Harrisburg, PA 17105

## SERVICE BY E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAID

Steven C. Gray, Esq., Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North Second Street Suite 1102 Commerce Bldg. Harrisburg, PA 17101

Norman J. Kennard, Esq. Regina L. Matz, Esq. Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esq. 240 North Third Street Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Michelle Painter, Esq. Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030

Bradford M. Stern, Esq. Martin C. RothFelder, Esq. Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, N.J. 07090 Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esq. Leigh A. Hyer, Esq. Verizon 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esq. 150 North Radnor Chester Rd. Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

John J. Calkins, Esq.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005

Angela Hart-Davis, Esq.
John C. Dodge, Esq.
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006

Brian A. Rankin Vice President, Deputy General Counsel Comcast Cable Communications, LLC One Comcast Center, 50<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

Deanne M. O'Dell, Esq. WolfBlock, LLP 213 Market St., 9<sup>th</sup> Fl. P.O. Box 865 Harrisburg, PA 17108-0865

Joseph R. Stewart, Esq. Embarq 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, OH 43215 SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Joel H/Cheskis Assistant Consumer Advocate PA Attorney ID# 81617

jcheskis@paoca.org

Counsel for Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 \*82775



July 21, 2008

2000 JUL 21 PH 3: 2 SECRETARY'S BURE/

### VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Assistant Consumer Advocate Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101

## DOCUMENT FOLDER

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

ORIGINAL

Dear Mr. Cheskis,

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania, enclosed please find Embarq Pennsylvania's Objections to Set III Interrogatories propounded by The Office of Consumer Advocate.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Joseph Stewart

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

JRS/jh

cc:

James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Joseph R. Stewart Senior Counsel 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 220-8625 (phone) (614) 224-3902 (fax)

# BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

CERTIFICATE OF SI	CE G	ः चि	
Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	) ) )	Docket No. I-00040195	2009 JUL 21

I hereby certify that I have this 21<sup>st</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Objections were served upon the persons below, via first-class mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire
Painter Law Firm
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

N

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC 100 Pine Street Box 1166 Harrisburg, PA 17108 e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com John J. Calkins, Esquire
Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP
1301 K Street, NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
wer
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted,

John Dodge, Esquire

Joseph R. Stewart, Esquire
Admitted Pro Hac Vice

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania

50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Direct Phone: (614) 220-8625

Fax: (614) 224-3902

E-mail: joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com



# DOCUMENT FOLDER

July 21, 2008

#### VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc. 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 SECRETARY'S OUREAU

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Ms. Paiva,

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC *d/b/a* Embarq Pennsylvania, enclosed please find Embarq Pennsylvania's Responses Set I Interrogatories propounded by Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc., Verizon North Inc. and MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC *d/b/a* Verizon Access Transmission Services, LLC., (collectively "Verizon").

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Joseph Stewart

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

JRS/jh

cc: James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Joseph R. Stewart Senior Counsel 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 220-8625 (phone) (614) 224-3902 (fax)



Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	) ) )	Docket No. I-00040105
<del></del>		<del></del>

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Like this 21<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Responses were served upon the persons below, via first-class mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32NW Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101 e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire Painter Law Firm 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC 100 Pine Street Box 1166 Harrisburg, PA 17108 e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com



John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com John Dodge, Esquire Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted,

Joseph R. Stewart, Esquire
Admitted Pro Hac Vice

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Direct Phone: (614) 220-8625

Fax: (614) 224-3902

E-mail: joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com



NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

# DOCUMENT FOLDER

July 21, 2008

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street 5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Forum Place Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and Intra LATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund; Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Neskis:

Enclosed please find the Objections of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to the OCA's Interrogatories Set III, Nos. 1-19.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

THOMAS, LONG NIESEN & KENNARD

By:

No**m**nan J. Kennard

NJK:tlt enclosure

cc: Per Certificate of Service

James J. McNulty, Secretary (Certificate of Service only)

Hon. Susan D. Colwell (Certificate of Service only)



I hereby certify that I have this 21<sup>st</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Objections of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to OCA's Interrogatories, Set III, Nos. 1-19, upon the persons listed below by email and first class mail, postage prepaid:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
icheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 East Tower Washington, DC 20005 (212) 408-6432 jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (908) 301-1211 mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan D. Paiva Verizon Pennsylvania Inc. Verizon North 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire
The United Telephone Co. of PA LLC
d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania
240 North Third Street, Suite 201
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 236-1385
sue.e.benedek@embarg.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation/Govt. Affairs 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reston, VA 20191 Benjamin.Aron 25 Process

Normand. Kennard A Attorney ID No. 29921 2006 JUL 21 PH 3: 05





NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

July 22, 2008



Suzan D. Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32N Philadelphia. PA 19103

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and Intra LATA Toll Rates of Burgl Carriors, and the Repneytyppia Universal Service Fund: Decket No.

of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund; Docket No.

I-00040105

Dear Ms Valva:

Enclosed please find the Answers of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

By:

**1** Kennard

NJK:tlt enclosure

CC:

Per Certificate of Service

James J. McNulty, Secretary (Certificate of Service only)

Hon. Susan D. Colwell (Certificate of Service only)

SECRETARY'S SUBFAL

103 . 1111 21. . . . . . . . . . .

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Answer of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests, upon the persons listed below by electronic mail, and served VZ I-8 and VZ I-41 via first class mail, postage prepaid:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
jcheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 East Tower Washington, DC 20005 (212) 408-6432 jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire
Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire
Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C.
625 Central Avenue
Westfield, NJ 07090
(908) 301-1211
mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan D. Paiva Verizon Pennsylvania Inc. Verizon North 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire
The United Telephone Co. of PA LLC
d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania
240 North Third Street, Suite 201
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 236-1385
sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation/Govt. Affairs 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reston, VA 20191 Benjamin.Aron@sprint.com

A Attorney ID No. 29921



NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

July 31, 2008

Via Electronic Mail and First Class Mail

Suzan D. Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 32N Philadelphia, PA 19103

DOCUMENT FOLDER

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and Intra LATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund; Docket No. I-00040105



Enclosed please find the Answers of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to the Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests Nos. 20 and 33.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours.

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

Βv

ornan J. Kennard

NJK:tlt enclosure

CC:

Per Certificate of Service

James J. McNulty, Secretary (Certificate of Service only) Hon. Susan D. Colwell (Certificate of Service only)

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 31<sup>st</sup> day of July, 2008, served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Answer of The Pennsylvania Telephone Association to Verizon Companies' First Set of Data Requests Nos. 20 and 33, upon the persons listed below via electronic mail:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
jcheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(212) 408-6432
jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (908) 301-1211 mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan D. Paiva
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North
1717 Arch Street, 10W
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 466-4755
Suzan D. Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire The United Telephone Co. of PA LLC d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 236-1385 sue.e.benedek@embarg.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation/Govt. Affairs 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reston, VA 20191 Benjamin.Aron@sprint.com

Normand Attorney ID No. 29921

# DOCUMENT FOLDER



August 1, 2008

#### **VIA ELECTRONIC AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL**

RECEIVED

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc. 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19103

AUG - 1 ZUUB

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund – Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Ms. Paiva,

On behalf of The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania, enclosed please find Embarq Pennsylvania's Updated Responses Set I Interrogatories propounded by Verizon Pennsylvania, Inc., Verizon North Inc. and MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services, LLC., (collectively "Verizon"). Please note that these responses include information CONFIDENTIAL TO EMBARQ PA and should be treated as such.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Joseph Stewart

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

JRS/jh

cc:

James J. McNulty, Secretary (letter and certificate only)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Joseph R. Stewart Senior Counsel 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 220-8625 (phone) (614) 224-3902 (fax)

## BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and	)	
	,	D - 1-4 N - 1 00040105
IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the	)	Docket No. I-00040105
Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	)	
	)	

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this 1<sup>st</sup> day of August, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing Updated Responses was served upon the persons below, via first-class and electronic mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire
Painter Law Firm
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087

e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire
McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108
e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP 1301 K Street, NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reson, VA 20191 e-mail: Benjamin.aron@sprint.com John Dodge, Esquire Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully submitted,

Joseph R Stewart, Esquire
Admitted Pro Hac Vice

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600

Columbus, Ohio 43215 Direct Phone: (614) 220-8625

Fax: (614) 224-3902

E-mail: joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com

## PAINTER LAW FIRM, PLLC

13017 DUNHILL DRIVE FAIRFAX, VIRGINIA 22030

MICHELLE PAINTER ATTORNEY AT LAW

DOCUNITE N

703.201.8378

FA X 703.968.5936

E-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

August 4, 2008

Via Overnight Delivery

The Honorable Susan Colwell Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street Harrisburg, PA 17120 RECEIVED

AUG, 0 4 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund,

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

This letter is to request that both the PTA and Embarq Answers to Verizon's July 24, 2008 Motion to Compel discovery responses be disregarded as untimely.

Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code §5.342(g), a party must answer a Motion to Compel within five days of service. AT&T filed its Answer timely on July 29, 2008. I was surprised when PTA and Embarq did not respond to Verizon's Motion to Compel on that same date, but instead filed three days later on August 1, 2008. While I subsequently learned that PTA and Embarq had asked whether Verizon would object to a delay in the PTA or Embarq Answers, neither PTA nor Embarq conferred with AT&T. A private, partial agreement between a subset of the parties is an inadequate basis for extending a statutorily mandated due date. Both PTA and Embarq were required to obtain all parties' consent, and more importantly, obtain an extension from the presiding officer. They did neither.

I was further surprised to see that PTA and Embarq both took advantage of their self-granted extensions by responding to AT&T's timely filed arguments. Thus, in addition to granting themselves extensions of the filing deadline without seeking authority from Your Honor, both the PTA and Embarq have gained additional advantages not permitted under the Commission's rules.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> If PTA and Embarq had conferred with AT&T, of course professional courtesy would have required that we concur in the request of counsel; however, had they conferred, subject to Your Honor's approval, then AT&T would have filed simultaneously with the other responding parties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Although Verizon asked the discovery, all parties, including AT&T, have an interest in the responses. PTA and Embarq are required to serve their responses on all parties. Once Verizon issued its discovery questions, it did not make sense for AT&T to ask the exact same questions; instead, AT&T relies on the responses provided to Verizon's questions.

AT&T Letter to ALJ Susan Colv August 4, 2008 Page 2 of 2

To remedy these violations of the Commission's rules, AT&T respectfully asks that Your Honor disregard the PTA and Embarq Answers and not consider them in addressing Verizon's Motion to Compel. If, on the other hand, parties are going to be permitted to negotiate private, unilateral amendments to the Commission's regulations without a ruling from Your Honor, AT&T and the other parties should be advised of that fact in advance.

Stichelle Painter
Michelle Painter

cc:

Certificate of Service James McNulty, Secretary

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of AT&T's Letter to ALJ Susan Colwell upon the participants listed below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code Section 1.54 (related to service by a participant) and 1.55 (related to service upon attorneys).

Dated at Fairfax, Virginia, this 4th day of August 2008.

#### VIA E-MAIL AND FIRST CLASS MAIL

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 (717) 255-7600 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Suzan D. Paiva Verizon 1717 Arch Street Philadelphia PA 19103 (215) 466-4755 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 (908) 301-1211 mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 100 Pine Street Harrisburg PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 (717) 783-5048 jcheskis@paoca.org

Zsuzanna Benedek, Esquire **Embarq Corporation** 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 245-6346 sue.e.benedek@embarg.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> St, Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101 (717) 783-2525 sgray@state.pa.us

John Dodge Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 (202) 973-4205 JohnDodge@dwt.com

John J. Calkins, Esq. Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 East Tower Washington DC 20005 (212) 408-6432 icalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Sichellefainter



NORMAN J. KENNARD Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

August 6, 2008

Honorable Susan D. Colwell Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

RECEIVED

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll

Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund,

Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

AT&T's letter to you dated August 4, 2008 requests that the Answers of the Pennsylvania Telephone Association and Embarg Pennsylvania to Verizon's Motion to Compel discovery responses "be disregarded as untimely." The claims made in the letter are distortive. This letter seeks to correct those misimpressions.

By way of background, upon the filing by Verizon of its Set I interrogatories, the PTA initiated contact with Verizon to discuss objections and possible resolution. Verizon invited AT&T to participate in the session stating that AT&T had drafted some of the interrogatories, including those that were under discussion. Counsel for AT&T, in fact, did participate and take positions relative to whether those interrogatories could be revised or withdrawn. An e-mail exchange documenting the participation of AT&T counsel is attached hereto.

Despite the fact that AT&T was involved in drafting the guestions, AT&T, for some reason, elected not to make that fact public in either the interrogatories themselves or in the Motion to Compel. It is clear, however, that AT&T is not a third party observer in the matter of Verizon Set I discovery, rather AT&T is a participating party aligned with Verizon.

Verizon's subsequent service of its Motion to Dismiss Objections and Compel Answers thereafter created some confusion. At 3:59 p.m. on the due date for the Motion to Compel (July 24, 2008), Verizon e-mailed to some parties (the undersigned was excluded from that e-mail) the Motion to Compel. That e-mail submission was later described by Verizon's counsel as a "non-final draft" and also failed to contain the requisite attachments. These various deficiencies were corrected with a "final" version served with attachments by e-mail at 6:47 p.m. upon all parties (including upon the undersigned) with the note:

The electronic copies of the Verizon Companies' motions to dismiss the objections of the PTA's and Embarg's objections and to compel answers to discovery sent earlier today were incomplete and had production problems.

Please discard and replace them with the attached copies of the final documents.

The PTA notes that, on matters of service, Your Honor's Scheduling Order provides that "due dates are in-hand. "Parties may utilize e-mail to accomplish service on each other "if transmission occurs before 4:00 p.m. and hard copies follow." Moreover, "Parties shall use overnight mail if the electronic copy omits exhibits or attachments." Only as to discovery is service after 4:00 p.m. "deemed to be served the following day."

Under these rules, Verizon did not electronically serve its Motion upon the parties on the due date July 24, 2008.<sup>4</sup> There were two possible interpretations as to the resulting due date of a responsive Answer to this Motion (due five days from service of the Motion itself):

- The better approach assumes that, if the e-mail rule is not complied with, then service is calculated by the alternative, back-up method of delivery, in this case the U.S. Postal Service to which the 3 day mail rule applies,<sup>5</sup> so that Answers were due August 1, 2008.<sup>6</sup>
- The other, less compelling, theory is that the original deficiencies were cured by the subsequent 6:47 p.m. version which should be deemed to be effective service on July 25<sup>th</sup>, in which case, the answer was due on July 30<sup>th</sup>. This approach is inferior to the first as it presumes that lack of timely filing on July 24<sup>th</sup> can be cured by service past the due date, clearly not an acceptable practice with the other forms of service (by mail) set forth in the Commission's regulations, for example.

Verizon, the PTA and Embarq took a practical approach and agreed to overlook a minor snafu. Verizon voluntarily offered to the PTA that it would not object to an Answer submitted on Friday, August 1<sup>st</sup>. A copy of correspondence from counsel for Verizon to this effect is attached. The PTA and Embarq accepted this resolution for the late-filed Motion to Compel.

Neither PTA nor Embarq envisioned a need to bother Your Honor with what readily could be (and was) agreed upon by the moving entity and the entities which would have to respond to the Motion. AT&T, through its actions of not officially joining in the Motion, effectively appointed Verizon as the single point of contact for the Motion to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Scheduling Order at 8 (Para. 8)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Id. at 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Id. at 8 (Para. 8)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The issue here is not the timeliness with the filing at the Commission (it is marked as overnight delivery to the Secretary), only the service date upon the parties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The PTA did not physically receive the document by mail until five days later, July 29, 2008.

 $<sup>^6</sup>$  July 24<sup>th</sup> plus five day answer period (52 Pa. Code § 5.342(g)) plus the three day mail rule (§1.56 (b)) = August 1<sup>st</sup>.

Compel. If AT&T <u>had</u> joined in with Verizon and signed onto the Motion to Compel, Verizon, the PTA and Embarq would have coordinated with AT&T also.

Having hidden behind the Motion to Compel filed by Verizon, AT&T comes forward and now argues that the PTA and Embarq Answers filed on August 1<sup>st</sup> were unilaterally "self-granted" and somehow prejudiced AT&T such that the PTA and Embarq Answers should be disregarded. There are several flaws in these claims.

- 1. **There is no lateness**. As described above, the best interpretation is that Answers were not due until August 1<sup>st</sup>.
- 2. AT&T's own "Answer" should be disregarded. Having collaborated with Verizon in the drafting and negotiation of objections to the discovery, AT&T is a propounding party. An Answer to a Motion to Compel is not properly filed by such a party. AT&T should have undertaken to participate in the Motion to Compel.
- 3. **There is no prejudice**. Even were the due date calculated as July 30<sup>th</sup>, however, AT&T served the parties one day early on July 29<sup>th</sup> and, thus, the August 1<sup>st</sup> filing by the PTA and Embarq is not the source of AT&T's protest that the Answers were not filed simultaneously. In either event, AT&T elected not to join in the Motion to Compel, failed to communicate with Verizon, PTA or Embarq after the original service was conceded to be invalid, and then filed its own Answer too soon, a risk associated with making unwarranted assumptions about service dates.
- 4. **Prejudice was avoided**. By filing a simultaneous Answer, AT&T was seeking to deny the PTA and Embarq the opportunity to address all reasons supporting the discovery that AT&T helped draft. Simply stated, AT&T's real underlying complaint is that AT&T was unable to prejudice the other parties by denying them a response to the Motion to Compel. This was tactic was thwarted, albeit involuntarily, by AT&T's filing prematurely.

The PTA believes that the above effectively brings us back to a point where AT&T's letter should be disregarded and the matter considered as ripe for Your Honor to rule upon the Motion and Answers as filed by all the Parties, including AT&T.

Very truly yours,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

Norman Kennard

By:

NJK:tlt Enclosures

#### Norman Kennard

From: suzan.d.paiva@verizon.com

Sent: Monday, July 07, 2008 12:26 PM

To: Norman Kennard

Subject: RE: USF case; VZ Set I.

Norm.

Thanks for the message. I am consulting with Michelle and Chris and will get back to you with our substantive response ASAP.

Suzan

**From:** Norman Kennard [mailto:nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com]

Sent: Thursday, July 03, 2008 8:18 AM

To: Paiva, Suzan D.; painterlawfirm@verizon.net; carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Cc: Regina L. Matz; Jennifer M. Sultzaberger

Subject: USF case; VZ Set I.

Suzan, Michelle and Chris:

After reviewing your Set 1 discovery, a conference call with you yesterday and discussion with the PTA companies, we can agree to answer most of the questions, although some of it is far afield of the subject matter and scope of the case and is not relevant under an evidentiary standard. Nevertheless, without waiving any future right to object, most can be answered using existing information without performing objectionable special studies.

We would ask for a three year time limit on answering the following interrogatories:

- We will provide TRS reports limited to three years.
- 2. We will provide PUC annual reports and, for price cap companies, PSI/SPI reports for the last 3 years.
- 17. a. We will provide total company balance sheet and income statement for last three years. Also responsive to VZ I-22. (This actually provides an income statement, which you did not request).

Five years would seem excessive. We propose three as reasonable.

We believe that the following are objectionable:

- 18. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. This level of specifics re access is not relevant. Access rates issues are stayed.
- 19. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. This level of specifics re access is not relevant. Access rates issues are stayed.

- 20. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. This level of specifics re access is not relevant. Access rates issues are stayed.
- 26. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. This level of specifics re access is not relevant. Access rates issues are stayed.
- 27. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. Company ownership/control is not an issue.
- 32. Object. Burdensome and irrelevant. This is not an investigation of the RLECs' networks or the provisioning of service.
- 33. Object. Irrelevant. Meeting Chapter 30 commitments are not at issue.

Please explain how these issues/areas of inquiry are not objectionable and the rationale for the information sought. Please identify whether there a compromise that we can reach to avoid burdening the ALJ.

Regards,
Norman J. Kennard
Thomas Long Niesen & Kennard
212 Locust Street, Suite 500
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Business: (717) 255-7600
Direct Dial: (717) 255-7627
nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

This message and any attachments may contain confidential or privileged information and are only for the use of the intended recipient of this message. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify the sender by return email, and delete or destroy this and all copies of this message and all attachments. Any unauthorized disclosure, use, distribution, or reproduction of this message or any attachments is prohibited and may be unlawful.

Any Federal tax advice contained herein is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used by you or any other person, for the purpose of avoiding any penalties that may be imposed by the Internal Revenue Code. This disclosure is made in accordance with the rules of Treasury Department Circular 230 governing standards of practice before the Internal Revenue Service. Any written statement contained herein relating to any Federal tax transaction or matter may not be used by any person without the express prior written permission in each instance of a partner of this firm to support the promotion or marketing of or to recommend any Federal tax transaction(s) or matter(s) addressed herein.

#### Norman Kennard

From: Chris Arfaa [carfaa@arfaalaw.com]

Sent: Thursday, July 24, 2008 6:47 PM

To: 'Dodge, John'; 'Colwell, Susan'; 'Aron, Benjamin J [GA]'; Norman Kennard; Regina L. Matz;

Jennifer M. Sultzaberger; mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com; jcalkins@sonnenschein.com; jcheskis@paoca.org; bsheridan@paoca.org; Cappleby@paoca.org; bobloube@earthlink.net;

roger@fsconline.com; sue.e.benedek@embarq.com; joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com; russell.r.gutshall@embarq.com; dbonner@sonnenschein.com; sgray@state.pa.us; abuca@aol.com; painterlawfirm@verizon.net; mkeffer@att.com; psshapiro@att.com;

ppolacek@mwn.com; skeddie@mwn.com

Subject: I-00040105 - Verizon Companies' Motions to Dismiss Objections and to Compel

Importance: High

Attachments: 20080724.MTC-PTA.pdf; 20080724.MTC-EBQ.pdf

Judge Colwell and Counsel:

The electronic copies of the Verizon Companies' motions to dismiss the objections of the PTA's and Embarq's objections and to compel answers to discovery sent earlier today were incomplete and had production problems. Please discard and replace them with the attached copies of the final documents.

I apologize for any inconvenience.

Thank you.

Chris Arfaa (610) 977-2001

STATEMENT OF CONFIDENTIALITY: The information contained in this electronic message and any attachments to this message is intended for the exclusive use of the addressee(s). This communication is intended to be and to remain confidential and may be subject to attorney-client communication and/or attorney work product privileges. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not read, print, copy or distribute this message or any attachments. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender by reply e-mail or by telephone at (888) 300-0141 (toll-free) and permanently destroy this message and any attachments.

**From:** Dodge, John [mailto:JohnDodge@dwt.com]

Sent: Tuesday, July 22, 2008 10:47 AM

**To:** Colwell, Susan; Aron, Benjamin J [GA]; nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com; rmatz@thomaslonglaw.com; jms@thomaslonglaw.com; mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com; carfaa@arfaalaw.com; jcalkins@sonnenschein.com; jcheskis@paoca.org; bsheridan@paoca.org; Cappleby@paoca.org; bobloube@earthlink.net; roger@fsconline.com; sue.e.benedek@embarq.com; joseph.r.stewart@embarq.com; russell.r.gutshall@embarq.com; dbonner@sonnenschein.com; sgray@state.pa.us; abuca@aol.com; painterlawfirm@verizon.net; mkeffer@att.com; psshapiro@att.com; ppolacek@mwn.com; skeddie@mwn.com **Subject:** Executed Protective Order -- I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell, et al:

Attached please find executed Appendix A from the Protective Order on behalf of Comcast. Hard copy to follow via U.S. Mail.

Kindly direct any questions regarding this matter to the undersigned.

Sincerely,

#### John Dodge | Davis Wright Tremaine LLP

1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 200 | Washington, DC 20006 Tel: (202) 973-4205 | Fax: (202) 973-4499

Email: johndodge@dwt.com | Website: www.dwt.com

Anchorage | Bellevue | Los Angeles | New York | Portland | San Francisco | Seattle | Shanghai | Washington, D.C.



Please consider the environment before printing this email.

Circular 230 - To comply with IRS rules, we must inform you that this message (including any attachment) if it contains advice relating to federal taxes, was not intended or written to be used, and it cannot be used, for the purpose of avoiding penalties that may be imposed under federal tax law. Under these rules, a taxpayer may rely on professional advice to avoid federal tax penalties only if that advice is reflected in a comprehensive tax opinion that conforms to stringent requirements under federal law.

#### Norman Kennard

From: Chris Arfaa [carfaa@arfaalaw.com]

Sent: Thursday, July 24, 2008 6:47 PM

To: sue.e.benedek@embarq.com; Norman Kennard

Subject: Pa USF

Norm and Sue-

As discussed, haste made waste of my filings today. We agree that you have until August 1 to respond.

Law Office of Christopher M. Arfaa, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245

T: 610.977.2001 F: 610.977-0043

STATEMENT OF CONFIDENTIALITY: The information contained in this electronic message and any attachments to this message is intended for the exclusive use of the addressee(s). This communication is intended to be and to remain confidential and may be subject to attorney-client communication and/or attorney work product privileges. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not read, print, copy or distribute this message or any attachments. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender by reply e-mail or by telephone at (888) 300-0141 (toll-free) and permanently destroy this message and any attachments.

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 6<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2008, served a true and correct copy of the foregoing letter upon the persons listed below via electronic mail and first class mail, postage prepaid at Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, as follows:

Joel H. Cheskis, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5<sup>th</sup> Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg PA 17101-1923
(717) 783-5048
jcheskis@paoca.org

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166, 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 (717) 232-8000 PPOLACEK@MWN.COM

Christopher M. Arfaa CHRISTOPHER M. ARFAA, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 (610) 977-2001 carfaa@arfaalaw.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600 East Tower Washington, DC 20005 (212) 408-6432 icalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire
Martin C. Rothfelder, Esquire
Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C.
625 Central Avenue
Westfield, NJ 07090
(908) 301-1211
mcrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
Suite 1102, Commerce Building
300 North Second Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 783-2525
sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire 13017 Dunhill Drive Fairfax, VA 22030 (703) 201-8378 painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Suzan D. Paiva Verizon PA Inc., Verizon North 1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire
The United Telephone Co. of PA LLC
d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania
240 North Third Street, Suite 201
Harrisburg, PA 17101
(717) 236-1385
sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation/Govt. Affairs 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reston, VA 20191 Benjamin.Aron@sprint.com

Mortinary Kennard Attorney ID No. 29921 Suzan DeBusk Paiva Assistant General Counsel Pennsylvania



1717 Arch Street, 10W Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tel: (215) 466-4755 Fax: (215) 563-2658 Suzan.D.Paiva@Verizon.com

### DOCUMENT FOLDER

August 6, 2008

RECEIVED

VIA UPS OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Joel Cheskis, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923 AUG 06 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

RE: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Mr. Cheskis:

Enclosed please find the Verizon Companies' Responses to the First Set of Interrogatories to Verizon, propounded by the Office of Consumer Advocate, in the above-referenced matter. Please note that these Responses include information that is Proprietary to Verizon, and of course should be handled as such.

Do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Respectfully,

Suzan D. Paiva

SDP/slb Enclosure

Via E-Mail and UPS Delivery

cc: Certificate of Service

Via UPS Delivery

cc: Secretary James J. McNulty (cover letter and certificate only)
The Honorable Susan Colwell (cover letter and certificate only)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of Verizon's Responses to the Office of Consumer Advocate's First Set of Interrogatories, upon the participants listed below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code Section 1.54 (related to service by a participant) and 1.55 (related to service upon attorneys).

Dated at Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, this 6th day of August, 2008.

#### **VIA E-MAIL AND UPS DELIVERY**

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Regina L. Matz, Esquire Jennifer M. Sultzaberter Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 Rural Telephone Company Coalition Joel Cheskis, Esquire
Barrett Sheridan, Esquire
Christy Appleby, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothfelder Stern, L.L.C. 625 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile; Omnipoint Communications Inc. d/b/a T-Mobile and Voicestream Pittsburgh LP d/b/a T-Mobile Nextel Communications, Inc. Zsuzanna Benedek, Esquire Embarq Corporation 240 North Third Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, P.C. 150 N. Radnor Chester Road, Suite F-200 Radnor, PA 19087-5245 Cingular Wireless LLC Cellco Parthership d/b/a Verizon Wireless Steven C. Gray, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate 300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> St, Suite 1102 Harrisburg, PA 17101

John C. Dodge, Esquire
Davis, Wright Tremaine, LLC
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
Comcast Digital Phone and Comcast
Business Communications, LLC

Michelle Painter
Painter Law Firm, PLLC
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
AT&T Communications of PA, LLC,
TCG Pittsburgh and TCG New Jersey

Pamela C. Polacek, Esquire Shelby A. Linton-Keddie, Esquire McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC P.O. Box 1166 100 Pine Street Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 Broadband Cable Association of PA John J. Calkins, Esquire Douglas Bonner, Esquire Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005

Sec. 1

Robert Loube 10601 Cavalier Drive Silver Spring, MD 20901

Suzan D. Pativa

Pennsylvania Bar ID No. 53853 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 (215) 466-4755

Attorney for
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Verizon North Inc.
MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC
d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services



Voice Data Internet Wireless Entertainment

EMBARQ"

Embarq Corporation 240 N. 3rd Street, Suite 201 Harrisburg, PA 17101 EMBARQ.com

## **DORIGINAL**

August 6, 2008

#### **VIA HAND DELIVERY**

Honorable Susan D. Colwell Office of Administrative Law Judge Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission 400 North Street, Second Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 DOCUMENT FOLDER SECRETARY'S DUSEAU

2009 KUG -6 FT 3: 56

Re:

Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and

IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers and the Pennsylvania

Universal Service Fund - Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

The United Telephone Company of Pennsylvania LLC d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania ("Embarq PA") is in receipt of correspondence dated August 4, 2008 from AT&T. Embarq PA has reviewed the Pennsylvania Telephone Association's ("PTA") response to AT&T. Rather than reiterate PTA's response to AT&T's misinformed letter, Embarq PA fully supports PTA and adopts the points made by PTA.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely

Con Dana dala

ZEB/ih

cc: James J. McNulty, Secretary (via hand delivery)

All Parties on the attached Certificate of Service (via first-class and electronic mail)

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek SENIOR COUNSEL

Voice: (717) 245-6346 Fax: (717) 236-1389

# BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

	)	
Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and	)	
IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the	)	Docket No. I-00040105
Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund	)	
	)	

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 6<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2008, served a true copy of the foregoing pleading was served upon the persons below, via first-class and electronic mail, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54:

Norman J. Kennard, Esquire Thomas, Long, Niesen and Kennard 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17109 e-mail: nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

Joel Cheskis, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: jcheskis@paoca.org

Suzan DeBusk Paiva, Esquire Verizon Pennsylvania 1717 Arch Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 e-mail: Suzan.D.Paiva@verizon.com

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 1102
Harrisburg, PA 17101
e-mail: sgray@state.pa.us

Michelle Painter, Esquire
Painter Law Firm
13017 Dunhill Drive
Fairfax, VA 22030
e-mail: painterlawfirm@verizon.net

Bradford M. Stern, Esquire Rothefelder Stern, LLC 620 Central Avenue Westfield, NJ 07090 Email: bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

Christopher M. Arfaa, Esquire Christopher M. Arfaa, PC 150 North Radnor Chester Road Suite F200 Radnor, PA 19087 e-mail: carfaa@arfaalaw.com

Pamela Polacek, Esquire
McNees Wallace and Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108
e-mail: ppolacek@mwn.com

John J. Calkins, Esquire
Sonnenschein, Nath and Rosenthal, LLP
1301 K Street, NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
e-mail: jcalkins@sonnenshchein.com

Benjamin J. Aron, Esquire Sprint Nextel Corporation 2001 Edmund Halley Drive, Room 208 Reston, VA 20191 e-mail: Benjamin.aron@sprint.com John Dodge, Esquire
Davis, Wright, Tremaine, LLP
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
e-mail: johndodge@dwt.com

Respectfully Submitted,

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire

PA ID No. 60451

The United Telephone Company of PA LLC

d/b/a Embarq Pennsylvania 240 North Third Street, Suite 201

Harrisburg, PA 17101

Direct Phone: (717) 245-6346 Facsimile: (717) 236-1389

Email: sue.e.benedek@embarq.com

## ROTHFELDER STERN, L.L.C.

LAW OFFICES

MARTIN C. ROTHFELDER\*\*\*

MCrothfelder@rothfelderstern.com

BRADFORD M. STERN\*\*

bmstern@rothfelderstern.com

\*ALSO ADMITTED IN NH

\*ALSO ADMITTED IN MO

**‡ALSO ADMITTED IN PA** 

PALSO ADMITTED IN NY

DOCUMENT FOLDER

625 CENTRAL AVENUE WESTFIELD, NJ 07090 TELEPHONE (908) 301-1211 FAX (908) 301-1212

19 DOVE STREET SUITE 202 ALBANY, NY 12210 TELEPHONE (518) 253-8750

August 7, 2008

Via E-Mail and First Class Mail

Honorable Susan D. Colwell Administrative Law Judge Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265 RECEIVED

AUG 1 2 2008

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Re: Investigation Regarding Intrastate Access Charges and IntraLATA Toll Rates of Rural Carriers, and the Pennsylvania Universal Service Fund Docket No. I-00040105

Dear Judge Colwell:

I am writing to advise Your Honor that I will not be present at the August 12 hearing as counsel of record for T-Mobile. T-Mobile has not made any filings either supporting or opposing the various motions pending before Your Honor at this time.

T-Mobile does desire to note for the record that, as Your Honor is aware, the subject matter of this hearing may be enlarged and/or clarified as a result of petitions for reconsideration pending before the Commission. The Commission has not yet ruled on those petitions to the best of T-Mobile's knowledge. T-Mobile therefore requests that any of the rulings that Your Honor makes regarding the pending motions be subject to any changes in the scope of this proceeding as a result of the Commission's rulings on the pending reconsideration petitions, and that all the parties have the opportunity to present their views and positions on the subject matters of the motions upon and in light of the Commission's anticipated rulings.

Printed on Recycled Paper

Honorable Susan D. Colwell Page 2 August 7, 2008

I thank Your Honor for considering the matters stated herein.

Very truly yours,

Bradford M. Stern

cc: Counsel of Record