LAW OFFICES PINNOLA & BOMSTEIN

MICHAEL S. BOMSTEIN PETER J. PINNOLA

ELKINS PARK OFFICE 8039 OLD YORK ROAD ELKINS PARK, PA 19027 (215) 635-3070 FAX (215) 635-3944

100 SOUTH BROAD STREET, SUITE 2126 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19110 (215) 592-8383 FAX (215) 574-0699 EMAIL mbomstein@gmail.com

MT. AIRY OFFICE 7727 GERMANTOWN AVENUE, SUITE 100 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19119 (215) 248-5800

> REPLY TO: Center City

May 29, 2019

Via Electronic Filing

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, Second Floor Harrisburg, PA 17120

Re: Flynn, et al. v. Sunoco Pipeline L.P., Docket Nos. C-2018-3006116 and P-2018-3006117

FLYNN COMPLAINANTS' RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO SUNOCO'S MOTION TO STRIKE FILINGS DISALLOWED PURSUANT TO THE COMMISSION'S RULES OF PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Attached for electronic filing with the Commission is Flynn Complainants' Response in Opposition to Sunoco's Motion to Strike Filings Disallowed Pursuant to the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure.

If you have any questions regarding this filing, please contact the undersigned.

Very truly yours

MICHAELS, BOMSTEIN, ESQ

MSB:mik

cc: Judge Barnes (Via email and First Class Mail)
Per Certificate of Service

BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Meghan Flynn, et al.

C-2018-3006116

v.

P-2018-3006117

Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.

FLYNN COMPLAINANTS' ANSWER TO SUNOCO'S MOTION TO STRIKE FILINGS

Flynn Complainants, by their attorney, Michael S. Bomstein, having been served with Sunoco's Motion to Strike Filings Disallowed Pursuant to the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure ("the Motion"), and desiring to oppose same, hereby answers as follows.

Sunoco recites 52 Pa. Code § 5.1(a) as limiting the pleadings in a formal proceeding. Section 5.1(a)(6) identifies motions as allowable; it does not, however, include responses to motions. By Sunoco's logic, responses to motions are not permitted. Of course, § 5.103 provides separately for motion practice.

Nothing in § 5.1(a) or § 5.103 precludes the filing of a supplemental answer or response. This clearly is in the discretion of the administrative law judge. Section 1.2 (a) states that the applicable rules "shall be liberally construed to secure the just, speedy and inexpensive determination of every action or proceeding to which it is applicable. The Commission or presiding officer at any stage of an action or proceeding may disregard an error or defect of procedure which does not affect the substantive rights of the parties."

Sunoco writes, "Complainants' original motions should have contained all of the arguments, fact, and law needed to support their motion." (Motion at 3). Complainants,

however, could not have included reference to matters that occurred after the date of their initial filing. Supplemental answers and responses are often filed in "fact-specific" cases when new information becomes available that will have a bearing on the outcome of a pending motion.¹

Complainants' Supplemental Discovery Memorandum, for example, was only a few pages long. Complainants had filed a Motion to Dismiss Objections and Compel Discovery.

Sunoco responded and added two arguments not addressed in the Flynn motion. Only those two arguments were touched upon in the Supplemental Discovery Memorandum.

On April 30, 2019, Flynn Complainants filed an Additional Discovery Memorandum based upon two new important events: development of a new sinkhole and the PUC's response to Eric Friedman's right-to-know case. This was brand new information that could not previously have been raised in Complainants' motion.

The PUC response in the Eric Friedman right-to-know case, for example, has now disclosed the existence of discoverable documents that contain information suggesting that a pipeline event could lead to mass destruction. While it is understandable that Sunoco may not want these documents to be disclosed, the information certainly ought to be considered by the Commission in deciding discovery issues.

On April 17, 2019, Complainants filed a reply Memo in response to Sunoco's opposition to their Motion for Reconsideration. That Memo, again, only addressed arguments raised by Sunoco in their Answer to Flynn Complainants' motion.

Counsel has found no express prohibition on the filing of a brief or memorandum in support of a motion. It is odd, however, that Sunoco has filed a motion that emphasizes the importance of strict compliance with the rules of pleading but then goes ahead and ignores those rules. Section 5.1 identifies motions as pleadings. Section 1.31(a) specifically provides that pleadings must be divided into numbered paragraphs. Sunoco's nine page "motion" has no numbered paragraphs at all. In reality, it is a brief or memorandum, just as many other motions filed by Sunoco are. Some have numbered paragraphs and some do not.

Sunoco cites no decisional authority in support of the claims in its motion/memorandum that the three additional/supplemental memoranda should be stricken. Complainants submit that the matters at stake in this formal proceeding are of substantial public importance.

It should be noted also that in a pending Commonwealth Court case² Sunoco applied to quash an appeal and DEP filed an answer. Sunoco then filed a reply to DEP's answer. DEP contended the reply was improper and should be stricken because the appellate rules provided only for an application and an answer, but not a reply to the answer.

Judge Ellen Ceisler summarily denied the application and allowed Sunoco's reply.

Sunoco's position in that case was correct.

For all of the reasons set forth above, Flynn Complainants pray the Commission deny Sunoco's Motion to Strike.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael S. Bomstein, Esq.

Pinnola & Bomstein PA ID No. 21328

Email: <u>mbomstein@gmail.com</u> Suite 2126 Land Title Building

100 South Broad Street Philadelphia, PA 19110

Tel.: (215) 592-8383

Attorney for Complainants

Dated: May 29, 2019

² Department of Environmental Protection v. Clean Air Council, et al., No. 313 CD 2019.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document upon the persons listed below, in accordance with the requirements of § 1.54 (relating to service by a party). This document has been filed electronically on the Commission's electronic filing system and served on the following via electronic and first-class mail:

SEE ATTACHED LIST

Michael S. Rometein

Dated: May 29, 2019

(PARTIES LIST UPDATED MARCH 28, 2019)

NEIL S WITKES ESQUIRE
ROBERT D FOX ESQUIRE
DIANA A SILVA ESQUIRE
MANKO, GOLD, KATCHER & FOX LLP
401 CITY AVENUE
VALA CYNWYD PA 19004
NWITKES@MANKOGOLD.COM
REPRESENTING SUNOCO PIPELINE
LP

THOMAS J SNISCAK, ESQUIRE
HAWKE MCKEON AND SNISCAK LLP
100 N TENTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17101
TJSNISCAK@HMSLEGAL.COM
REPRESENTING SUNOCO PIPELINE
LP

RICH RAIDERS ESQUIRE 606 NORTH 5TH STREET READING PA 19601 484.509.2715 <u>RICH@RAIDERSLAW.COM</u> REPRESENTING INTERVENOR ANDOVER HOMEOWNERS' ASSOCIATION INC.

ANTHONY D KANAGY ESQUIRE
POST & SCHELL PC
17 N SECOND ST 12TH FL
HARRISBURG PA 17101-1601
717.612.6034
<u>AKANAGY@POSTSCHELL.COM</u>
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
RANGE RESOURCES APPALACHIA

ERIN MCDOWELL ESQUIRE
3000 TOWN CENTER BLVD
CANONSBURG PA 15317
EMCDOWELL@RANGERESOURCES.
COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
RANGE RESOURCES APPALACHIA

STEPHANIE M WIMER ESQUIRE
PUC BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION
AND ENFORCEMENT
400 NORTH STREET, PO BOX 3265
HARRISBURG PA 17105-3265
STWIMER@PA.GOV
REPRESENTING PUC BUREAU OF
INVESTIGATION AND
ENFORCEMENT

LEAH ROTENBERG ESQUIRE
MAYS CONNARD & ROTENBERG LLP
1235 PENN AVE
SUITE 202
WYOMISSING PA 19610
610.400.0481
ROTENBERG@MCRATTORNEYS, COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
TWINS VALLEY SCHOOL DISTRICT

MARGARET A MORRIS ESQUIRE
REGER RIZZO & DARNALL
2929 ARCH STREET 13TH FLOOR
PHILADELPHIA PA 19104
215.495.6524

MMORRIS@REGERLAW.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR EAST
GOSHEN TOWNSHIP AND
INTERVENOR CHESTER COUNTY

VINCENT MATTHEW POMPO
ESQUIRE
LAMB MCERLANE PC
24 EAST MARKET ST
PO BOX 565
WEST CHESTER PA 19381
VPOMPO@LAMBMCERLANE.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR WEST
WHITELAND TOWNSHIP

MARK L FREED ESQUIRE
CURTIN & HEEFNER LLP
DOYLESTOWN COMMERCE CENTER
2005 S EASTON ROAD SUITE 100
DOYLESTOWN PA 18901
MLF@CURTINHEEFNER.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
UWCHLAN TOWNSHIP

JAMES R FLANDREAU
PAUL FLANDREAU & BERGER LLP
320 WEST FRONT ST
MEDIA PA 19063

<u>JFLANDREAU@PFBLAW.COM</u>
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
MIDDLETOWN TOWNSHIP

PATRICIA BISWANGER ESQUIRE 217 NORTH MONROE STREET MEDIA PA 19063 PATBINSWANGER@GMAIL.COM REPRESENTING INTERVENOR COUNTY OF DELAWARE

MICHAEL MADDREN, ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF THE SOLICITOR
COUNTY OF DELAWARE
GOVERNMENT CENTER BUILDING
201 WEST FRONT STREET
MEDIA, PA 19063
MADDRENM@CO.DELAWARE.PA.US
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
COUNTY OF DELAWARE

ALEX JOHN BAUMLER ESQUIRE
LAMB MCERLANE PC
24 EAST MARKET ST
BOX 565
WEST CHESTER PA 19381
ABAUMLER@LAMBMCERLANE.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
DOWNINGTOWN AREA SCHOOL
DISTRICT, ET AL.

GUY DONATELLI ESQUIRE LAMB MCERLANE PC 24 EAST MARKET ST BOX 565 WEST CHESTER PA 19381 GDONATELLI@LAMBMCERLANCE.C OM REPRESENTING INTERVENORS ROSE TREE MEDIA SCHOOL DISTRICT ,DELAWARE COUNTY & SEN. THOMAS H. KILLION

JAMES DALTON
UNRUH TURNER BURKE & FREES
PO BOX 515
WEST CHESTER PA 19381
610.692.1371
JDALTON@UTBF.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR WEST
CHESTER AREA SCHOOL DISTRICT

JAMES BYRNE ESQUIRE
MCNICHOL BYRNE & MATLAWSKI PC
1223 N PROVIDENCE RD
MEDIA PA 19063
JJBYRNE@MBMLAWOFFICE.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR
THORNBURY TOWNSHIP

DAVID J.BROOMAN
RICHARD SOKORAI
MARK R. FISCHER
HIGH SWARTZ
40 EAST AIRY STREET
NORRISTOWN, PA 19404
DBROOMAN@HIGHSWARTZ.COM
REPRESENTING INTERVENOR WEST
GOSHEN TOWNSHIP

JOSH MAXWELL
MAYOR OF DOWNINGTOWN
4 W. LANCASTER AVENUE
DOWNINGTOWN, PA 19335
JMAXWELL@DOWNINGTOWN.ORG
PRO SE INTERVENOR

THOMAS CASEY
1113 WINDSOR DR.
WEST CHESTER, PA 19380
TCASEYLEGAL@GMAIL.COM
PRO SE INTERVENOR

VIRGINIA MARCILLE-KERSLAKE 103 SHOEN ROAD EXTON, PA 19341 VKERSLAKE@GMAIL.COM PRO SE INTERVENOR LAURA OBENSKI
14 SOUTH VILLAGE AVENUE
EXTON,PA 19341
LIOBENSKI@GMAIL.COM
PRO SE COMPLAINANT

MELISSA DIBERNARDINO 1602 OLD ORCHARD LANE WEST CHESTER, PA 19380 <u>LISSDIBERNARDION@GMAIL.COM</u> PRO SE COMPLAINANT

REBECCA BRITTON
211 ANDOVER DRIVE
EXTON, PA 19341
RBRITTONLEGAL@GMAIL.COM
PRO SE COMPLAINANT