**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Meghan Flynn :

Rosemary Fuller :

Michael Walsh :

Nancy Harkins : C-2018-3006116

Gerald McMullen : P-2018-3006117

Caroline Hughes and :

Melissa Haines :

 :

Andover Homeowners Association : C-2018-3003605

 :

Melissa DiBernardino :  C-2018-3005025

:

Rebecca Britton : C-2019-3006898

 :

Laura Obenski : C-2019-3006905

 :

 v. :

 :

Sunoco Pipeline, L.P. :

**ORDER**

**Amending Procedural Schedule; Denying Flynn Complainants’ Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Direct Testimony and Exhibits; and Denying Flynn Complainants’ Motion to Determine Sufficiency of Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Objections and Answer to Request for Admissions**

On March 16, 2020, Flynn Complainants (Complainants) filed a Motion For Leave to File Supplemental Direct Testimony and Exhibits regarding three reports pertaining to pipeline construction activities on the Mariner 2 and 2X in Huntingdon County and pipeline construction of ETC Northeast Pipeline, LLC involving the Revolution Pipeline in Beaver County. On April 6, 2020, Sunoco Pipeline, L.P. (SPLP or Respondent) filed an Answer Opposing Flynn Complainants’ Motion for Leave to Submit Additional Evidence.

 On April 13, 2020, Complainants filed a Motion to Determine Sufficiency of Respondent’s Objections and Answer to Request for Admissions (Motion). SPLP filed a timely response. These Motions are ripe for a decision.

Complainants request leave to submit supplemental testimony and exhibits including 3 reports obtained recently from the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) concerning pipeline construction on the Mariner East 2 and 2X in Huntingdon County and the ETC Northeast Pipeline, LLC’s pipeline construction of the Revolution Pipeline project in Butler County. Additionally, Flynn Complainants move to compel SPLP to answer a set of Requests for Admissions served on March 16, 2020 (Admissions) concerning two Consent Orders and Agreements (COA) and attachments thereto between (collectively, DEP documents) – (1) a COA between SPLP and DEP regarding construction of the Mariner East 2/2X pipeline project at Raystown Lake in Huntington County; and (2) a COA between DEP and ETC Northeast Pipeline, LLC regarding the Revolution pipeline project, which traverses Allegheny, Beaver, Butler and Washington Counties.

In keeping with my prior discovery ruling regarding this issue, I find SPLP’s objections to these Admissions and the Motion for Leave to Supplement Direct Testimony to be justified. The DEP documents relate to DEP permitting and construction issues in Huntingdon and Beaver Counties, outside of Chester and Delaware Counties. Additionally, the Admissions are an attempt to introduce evidence after Complainants’ direct case and they expand the scope of the proceeding. The scope of discovery is limited to relevant issues in the case as narrowed by the scope of Complainants’ direct testimony. To be newly discovered evidence, there must be a showing that the materials in question could not have been obtained through reasonable diligence at an earlier time. While the Motion alleges the existence of these documents was neither known nor knowable prior to the service of Admissions, I am persuaded by SPLP’s comparison of each Admission to the COAs available as of January 3, 2020 to find there was a basis for each Admission or enough information to provide a basis for an interrogatory obtaining the information requested in the Admission in the COA. The attachments to the COA are cumulative with respect to the Admissions. Therefore, in accordance with Section 5.350(e), SPLP will not be compelled to answer these Admissions pertaining to the DEP’s COA’s because they are not relevant to the issues in the instant case and exceed the scope of the Complainants’ direct case before the Commission. 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.350(e). *See, e.g.*, *Claudio v. Dean Machine Co.*, 831 A.2d 140, 146 (Pa. 2003) (“after-discovered evidence, to justify a new trial, must have been discovered after the trial, be such that it could not have been obtained at the trial by reasonable diligence, must not be cumulativeor merely impeach credibility, and must be such as would likely compel a different result.”) (quoting *Der Hagopian v. Eskandarian,* 396 Pa. 401, 153 A.2d 897 (1959), *cert. denied,* 361 U.S. 938, 80 S.Ct. 381, 4 L.Ed.2d 358 (1960)) (emphasis added). Additionally, Flynn Complainants’ Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Testimony and Exhibits will be denied.

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. Thatthe Flynn Complainants’ Motion to Determine Sufficiency of Respondent’s Objections and Answer to Request for Admissions is denied.
2. That Flynn Complainants’ Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Testimony and Exhibits is denied.
3. That the proposed procedural schedule at Docket No. C-2019-3006116 as outlined in Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Status Report filed on April 28, 2020 is adopted and the procedural schedule is amended as follows.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Respondent and Respondent-Aligned Intervenor Rebuttal Written Testimony  |   | June 15, 2020  |  |
| Complainants and Complainant-Aligned Intervenor Surrebuttal Written Testimony  |  | July 15, 2020  |  |
| Respondent and Respondent-Aligned Intervenor Written Rejoinder Outlines  |  | August 14, 2020  |  |
| Hearings  |  | September 29, 2020 - October 9, 2020 and October 13, 2020 – October 14, 2020  |  |
| Transcripts  |  | October 28, 2020  |  |
| Main Briefs  |  | December 14, 2020  |  |
| Reply Briefs  |  | December 29, 2020  |  |

Date: May 28, 2020 /s/

 Elizabeth Barnes

 Administrative Law Judge

**C-2018-3006116 et. al.- MEGHAN FLYNN et. al. v. SUNOCO PIPELINE LP**

*(Revised 1/16/20)*

MEGHAN FLYNN212 LUNDGREN ROADLENNI PA 19052*Complainant*

MICHAEL WALSH12 HADLEY LANEGLEN MILLS PA 19342 *Complainant*

GERALD MCMULLEN200 HILLSIDE DRIVEEXTON PA 19341

*Complainant*

MELISSA HAINES176 RONALD ROADASTON PA 19014*Complainant*

ERIN MCDOWELL ESQUIRE

3000 TOWN CENTER BLVD

CANONSBURG PA 15317

**725.754.5352**

*Representing Intervenor Range Resources Appalachia*

VINCENT MATTHEW POMPO ESQUIRE
WILLIAM R. CHRISTMAN IIILAMB MCERLANE PC24 EAST MARKET ST PO BOX 565WEST CHESTER PA 19381**610.701.4411
610.430.8000***Representing Intervenor West Whiteland Township*

GUY DONATELLI ESQUIRE

LAMB MCERLANE PC24 EAST MARKET STBOX 565WEST CHESTER PA 19381

**610.430.8000***Representing Intervenor Rose Tree Media School District*

JAMES DALTONUNRUH TURNER BURKE & FREESPO BOX 515WEST CHESTER PA 19381**610.692.1371***Representing Intervenor West Chester Area School District*

JOSH MAXWELL

MAYOR OF DOWNINGTOWN

4 W LANCASTER AVENUE DOWNINGTON PA 19335

*Intervenor*

THOMAS CASEY

1113 WINDSOR DR

WEST CHESTER PA 19380

*Intervenor*

MICHAEL BOMSTEIN ESQUIREPINNOLA & BOMSTEINSUITE 2126 LAND TITLE BUILDING100 SOUTH BROAD STREETPHILADELPHIA PA 19110**215.592.8383
*Accepts E-Service****Representing Complainants*

ROSEMARY FULLER226 VALLEY ROAD MEDIA PA 19063**610.358.1262*Accepts E-Service***

*Complainant*

NANCY HARKINS

1521 WOODLAND RDWEST CHESTER PA 19382**484.678.9612*Accepts E-Service***

*Complainant*

CAROLINE HUGHES 1101 AMALFI DRIVE WEST CHESTER PA 19380**484.883.1156*Accepts E-Service***

CURTIS STAMBAUGH ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSELSUNOCO PIPELINE LP212 N THIRD STREET SUITE 201HARRISBURG PA 17101**717.236.1731**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

NEIL S WITKES ESQUIRE

ROBERT D FOX ESQUIRE

DIANA A SILVA ESQUIRE

MANKO, GOLD, KATCHER & FOX LLP

401 CITY AVENUE

VALA CYNWYD PA 19004

**484.430.2314**

**484.430.2312**

**484.430.2347**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

THOMAS J SNISCAK ESQUIREHAWKE MCKEON AND SNISCAK LLP100 N TENTH STREET HARRISBURG PA 17101**717.236.1300*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

RICH RADERS ESQUIRE606 NORH 5TH STREET READING PA 19601**484.509.2715*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Andover Homeowners’ Association Inc.*

ANTHONY D KANAGY ESQUIRE

GARRET P LENT ESQUIRE

POST & SCHELL PC

17 N SECOND ST 12TH FL

HARRISBURG PA 17101-1601

**717.612.6034**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Range Resources Appalachia*

LEAH ROTENBERG ESQUIRE MAYS CONNARD & ROTENBERG LLP1235 PENN AVE SUITE 202WYOMISSING PA 19610**610.400.0481*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Twins Valley School District*

MARGARET A MORRIS ESQUIREREGER RIZZO & DARNALL2929 ARCH STREET 13TH FLOORPHILADELPHIA PA 19104**215.495.6524*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor East Goshen Township*

MARK L FREED ESQUIRE
JOANNA WALDRON ESQUIRECURTIN & HEEFNER LLPDOYLESTOWN COMMERCE CENTER 2005 S EASTON ROAD SUITE 100DOYLESTOWN PA 18901**267.898.0570*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Uwchlan Township*

JAMES R FLANDREAUPAUL FLANDREAU & BERGER LLP320 WEST FRONT ST MEDIA PA 19063**610.565.4750*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Middletown Township*

PATRICIA BISWANGER ESQUIREPATRICIA BISWANGER217 NORTH MONROE STREETMEDIA PA 19063**610.608.0687*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor County of Delaware*

JAMES J. BYRNE, ESQ.
KELLY SULLIVAN, ESQUIRE
MCNICHOL BYRNE & MATLAWSKI PC
1223 N. PROVIDENCE ROAD
**610.565.4322
*Accepts E-Service*** *Counsel for Intervenor Delaware County*
*Counsel for Intervenor Thornbury Township*

MELISSA DIBERNARDINO

1602 OLD ORCHARD LANE

WEST CHESTER PA 19380

**484.881.2829**
***Accepts E-Service***

VIRGINIA MARCILLE KERSLAKE

103 SHOEN ROAD

EXTON PA 19341

**215.200.2966**

***Accepts E-Service****Intervenor*

LAURA OBENSKI

14 S VILLAGE AVE

EXTON PA 19341

**484.947.6149**

***Accepts E-Service***

REBECCA BRITTON

211 ANDOVER DR

EXTON PA 19341

**215.776.7516**

***Accepts E-Service***

MICHAEL P PIERCE ESQUIRE

MICHAEL P PIERCE PC

17 VETERANS SQUARE

PO BOX 604

MEDIA PA 19063
**610.566.0911
*Accepts E-Service****Representing Edgmont Twp.*

KATHRYN URBANOWICZ ESQUIRE

JOSEPH OTIS MINOTT ESQUIRECLEAN AIR COUNCIL135 SOUTH 19TH STREET SUITE 300PHILADELPHIA PA 19103**215.567.4004*Accepts E-Service***