

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3045192 <i>et al.</i> , (Water)
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	R-2023-3045193 <i>et al.</i> , (Wastewater)
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
Veolia Water Pennsylvania, Inc.	:	

PROTECTIVE ORDER

On March 28, 2024, Veolia Water Pennsylvania, LLC (VWPA) filed a Petition for a Protective Order in the above-captioned proceedings pursuant to the provisions of 52 Pa. Code § 5.365(a). In its Petition, VWPA avers that its proposed Protective Order has been shared with the other parties and I&E, the OCA, and CAUSE-PA advise that they do not object to the entry of the proposed protective order. As of the time the Petition was filed, OSBA had not responded to VWPA’s counsel.

After reviewing the Petition and attached Order, I emailed the parties asking whether OSBA had any objection to the Petition being granted. Its counsel responded it did not.

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. That the Petition for a Protective Order is granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraph 2 below, which are filed with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (“Commission”), produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during these proceedings. All persons now and hereafter granted access to the materials and information

identified in Paragraph 2 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Protective Order.

2. That materials subject to this Protective Order are all correspondence, documents, data, information, excerpts, summaries, studies, methodologies and other materials (including materials derived therefrom) which a party or an affiliate of a party furnishes in this proceeding pursuant to Commission rules and regulations, formal and informal discovery procedures, testimony or oral examination, or provided as a courtesy to a party to this proceeding, which are claimed to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and which are designated “PROPRIETARY INFORMATION” or “CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY” or “PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter collectively referred to as “Proprietary Information”).

3. That, in addition, the parties may designate extremely sensitive Proprietary Information as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL MATTER” (hereinafter referred to as “Highly Confidential Information”) and thus secure the additional protections set forth in this Protective Order pertaining to such material.

4. That Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available, solely for use in this proceeding, to VWPA; the Office of Consumer Advocate (“OCA”); the Office of Small Business Advocate (“OSBA”), the Commission’s Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), the Coalition for Affordable Utility Services and Energy Efficiency in Pennsylvania (“CAUSE-PA”), and additional parties, if any. To the extent that Proprietary Information or Highly Confidential Information is placed in the Commission’s report folders, such information shall be handled in accordance with routine Commission procedures inasmuch as the report folders are not subject to public disclosure. To the extent that Proprietary Information or Highly Confidential Information is placed in the Commission's testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Protective Order. Public inspection of Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.

5. That Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information shall be made available to counsel of record in this proceeding pursuant to the following procedures:

a. Proprietary Information. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, a party's counsel, upon execution of the attached Appendix A, may afford access to Proprietary Information made available by another party ("the producing party") to the party's expert(s) and staff (except that the Consumer Advocate, the Deputy Consumer Advocate, the Small Business Advocate, and support staff in OCA and OSBA need not execute Appendix A, provided that OCA's and OSBA's counsel execute Appendix A). Any information provided under this provision may be used only for and to the extent that it is necessary for participation in this proceeding. Any person obtaining information disclosed through this provision may not use that information to gain any commercial advantage and any person obtaining information may not forward it to any person to gain commercial advantage.

b. Highly Confidential Information. Where information is asserted to be Highly Confidential Information, it will be made available for inspection and review as provided for in this Protective Order and copying only as specified herein. The producing party shall permit counsel for VWPA, OCA, OSBA, I&E, CAUSE-PA and other counsel to take custody of a copy of such Highly Confidential Information, provided that it shall not be copied, except for counsel, and the OCA's, OSBA's, I&E's, and CAUSE-PA's in-house staff, independent consultants, or non-lawyer representatives, in accordance with the protocols set forth below and shall be returned as provided for in this Protective Order. Such Highly Confidential Information may be provided by the OCA or OSBA to the Consumer Advocate, the Deputy Consumer Advocate, the Small Business Advocate, or eligible in-house staff without the need for execution of Appendix A. Additionally, such Highly Confidential Information may be provided by the OCA or OSBA or other counsel to its eligible independent consultants (as defined in 52 Pa. Code § 5.365(d)) or other non-lawyer representatives who are assisting counsel with these proceedings, provided that such consultants and non-lawyer representatives execute and return the attached Appendix A to the producing party pursuant to Paragraph 6 of this Protective Order.

c. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information except as authorized by order of the Commission or of the presiding Administrative Law Judge. No person who may be entitled to receive, or who is afforded access to any Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information, shall use or disclose such information for the purposes of business or competition, or any purpose other than the preparation for and conduct of this proceeding or any administrative or judicial review thereof.

6. Prior to making Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information available to any independent consultant or non-lawyer representatives, counsel shall, except as specifically exempted under Paragraph 5(b) of this Protective Order, deliver a copy of this Protective Order to such person and shall receive a written acknowledgment from that person in the form attached to this Protective Order and designated as Appendix A. Counsel shall promptly deliver to the producing party a copy of the executed Appendix A.

7. A producing party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information by affixing an appropriate proprietary stamp or type-written designation on such data or documents. Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information, the producing party shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information.

8. Any public reference to Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information by counsel or persons afforded access thereto shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information to fully understand the reference and not more. The Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

9. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in paragraph 8 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties or pursuant to Order of the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission or appellate court. Unresolved challenges arising under paragraph 10 shall be decided on petition by the presiding officer or the Commission as provided by 52 Pa. Code § 5.365(a). All such challenges will be resolved in conformity with existing rules, regulations, orders, statutes, precedent, etc., to the extent that such guidance is available.

10. The parties affected by the terms of this Protective Order shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information; to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information; to refuse or object to the production of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information on any proper ground, including but not limited to irrelevance, immateriality or undue burden; to seek an order permitting disclosure of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information beyond that allowed in this Protective Order; and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information beyond those provided in this Protective Order. If a challenge is made to the designation of a document or information as Proprietary or Highly Confidential, the party claiming that the information is Proprietary or Highly Confidential retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is necessary and appropriate.

11. This Protective Order shall continue to be binding throughout and after the conclusion of this proceeding.

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3045192 <i>et al.</i> , (Water)
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	R-2023-3045193 <i>et al.</i> , (Wastewater)
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
Veolia Water Pennsylvania, Inc.	:	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____ (the receiving party).

The undersigned has read the Protective Order dated _____, 2024, and understands that it deals with the treatment of Proprietary and Highly Confidential Information. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and to comply with, the terms and conditions of said Protective Order. In the case of an independent expert, the undersigned represents that he/she has complied with the provisions of paragraph 5 of the Protective Order prior to submitting this Acknowledgement.

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATE

R-2024-3045192, R-2024-3045193 - PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
v. VEOLIA WATER PENNSYLVANIA INC

DAVID P ZAMBITO ESQUIRE
COZEN O'CONNOR
17 NORTH SECOND ST SUITE 1410
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.703.5892
717.870.2725
dzambito@cozen.com
Accepts eService

PATRICK M CICERO ESQUIRE
CHRISTY APPLEBY ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET 5TH FLOOR
FORUM PLACE
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.5048
717.780.4517
pcicero@paoca.org
cappleby@paoca.org
Accepts eService

MICHAEL PODSKOCH ESQUIRE
BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND
ENFORCEMENT
400 NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.783.6151
mpodskoch@pa.gov
Accepts eService

SHARON E WEBB ESQUIRE
REBECCA LYTTLE ESQUIRE
NAZAARAH SABREE ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
FORUM PLACE
555 WALNUT STREET 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.2525
717.783.2831
swebb@pa.gov
relyttle@pa.gov
ra-sba@pa.gov
Served via email and first class mail

ELIZABETH R MARX ESQUIRE
JOHN SWEET ESQUIRE
LAUREN BERMAN ESQUIRE
RIA PEREIRA ESQUIRE
PA UTILITY LAW PROJECT
118 Locust Street
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.236.9486
717.701.3837
717.710.3825
emarx@pautilitylawproject.org
jsweet@pautilitylawproject.org
lberman@pautilitylawproject.org
rpereira@pautilitylawproject.org
Accepts eService

CHRIS HAYS
29 PENNROSE TALLEY
GARNET VALLEY PA 19060-1622
1.602.309.8654
4jetset@gmail.com
Accepts eService

ANDREW C BREINING
4500 LANCASTER ST
HARRISBURG PA 17111
1.910.280.1254
acbreining@gmail.com
Accepts eService

MERCEDES COFFMAN
19 W 8TH ST
BLOOMSBURG PA 17815
901.832.7616
mercedescoffman@yahoo.com
Accepts eService

KRISTEN KHAN
5484 Grouse Drive
HARRISBURG PA 17111
717.343.9506
kristenkhan757@yahoo.com
Accepts eService

KATELYN & HUNTER MOYER
60 WHITE OAK LANE
ETTERS PA 17319
717.608.9306
huntermoyer98@gmail.com
Accepts eService

ELISA GIUSTO
85 GREENSPRING DR
MECHANICSBURG PA 17050
570.902.5427
lisagi@pcom.edu
Accepts eService

NORMAN LOWE
2631 OLD BERWICK RD
BLOOMSBURG PA 17815
570.784.0870
janeandlarrylowe@gmail.com
Served via email and first class mail

JOHN & LINDA BROWN
7024 BROOKDALE DR
HARRISBURG PA 17111-5065
717.657.1189
717.576.0994
linda-rose@verizon.net
Served via email and first class mail

IDA GORMAN
563 BRIGHTON PLACE
MECHANICSBURG PA 17055
717.919.0280
ida.n.gorman@gmail.com
Served via email and first class mail